## Bantz, Gosch & Cremer, L.L.C.

◆Attorneys at Law ◆

Douglas W. Bantz (1909-1983) Kennith L. Gosch James M. Cremer Rory King Greg L. Peterson\* Richard A. Sommers Ronald A. Wager Melissa E. Neville Danelle J. Daugherty \*Also Licensed in North Dakota



November 29, 2005

305 SIXTH AVENUE, S.E. P.O. BOX 970 ABERDEEN, SD 57402-0970

> Telephone (605) 225-2232 Fax (605) 225-2497

Control Consideration

08475-004

Ms. Heather Forney
Acting Executive Director
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission
Capitol Building, 1st Floor
500 East Capitol Avenue
Pierre, SD 57501-5070

Re: In the Matter of the Petition of Northern Valley Communications, L.L.C.

for a 3-Year Waiver from Developing Company-Specific Cost-Based Intrastate

Switched Access Rates

Dear Ms. Forney:

Enclosed for filing is an original and ten (10) copies of the Petition of Northern Valley Communications, L.L.C.

I have also enclosed an extra copy of this letter to be date stamped and returned to me in the enclosed, self-addressed, postage prepaid envelope. If you have any questions, or if I may provide you with additional information, please contact me.

Sincerely,

JAMES M. CREMER

JMC:tmb

WVC\PUC Cost Study\PUC-Forney 2005-11-29

Enclosures

pc: James Groft (via electronic mail)

AFIEWED

SOUTH DAYOTA FUEL:

### BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION	)		UTILITIES COMMISS
OF NORTHERN VALLEY	)		
COMMUNICATIONS, L.L.C. FOR	)	Docket No.	
A 3-YEAR WAIVER FROM	)		
DEVELOPING COMPANY-SPECIFIC	)		
COST-BASED INTRASTATE SWITCHED	)		
ACCESS RATES	)		

#### **PETITION**

Northern Valley Communications, L.L.C. ("NVC"), pursuant to ARSD 20:10:27:11 and ARSD 20:10:27:02, hereby petitions the South Dakota Public Utilities Commission ("Commission") for: a 3-year waiver from developing company-specific cost-based intrastate switched access rates.

#### I. PETITIONER

Petitioner is a South Dakota corporation authorized to provide facilities-based local exchange service in South Dakota pursuant to the Certificate of Authority issued June 5, 1998 in Docket No. TC98-063. Petitioner had previously received a 3-year exemption from filing company-specific cost-based intrastate switched access rates in docket TC02-170 issued December 2, 2002.

#### II. CONTACT INFORMATION

Correspondence or communications pertaining to this petition should be directed to:

James Groft, CEO PO Box 320 Groton, SD 57445 Email: jgroft@nvc.net

Tel: (605) 725-1000

Fax: (605) 725-1050

And to:

James M. Cremer

Bantz, Gosch & Cremer, L.L.C

P.O. Box 970

Aberdeen, SD 57402-0970

Email: jcremer@bantzlaw.com

Tel: (605) 225-2232

Fax: (605) 225-2497

III. **DESCRIPTION OF PETITION** 

NVC is a facilities-based local exchange carrier and provides intrastate

switched access services to non-facilities based carriers. Pursuant to ARSD

20:10:27:11, a telecommunications company may petition the Commission to be

exempted from the requirements of developing cost-based intrastate switched

access rates based on company specific costs.

In this petition, NVC demonstrates it lacks the necessary financial or

managerial resources needed to determine company-specific cost-based intrastate

switched access rates and that the additional costs associated with developing

company-specific cost-based intrastate switched access rates outweigh any benefit

to the consumers of South Dakota.

IV. REQUEST FOR EXEMPTION

1. Financial Records Are Not Compatible

Pursuant to ARSD 20:10:27:06, each carrier's carrier or association shall

file a tariff that is designed to recover no more than its intrastate switched access

2

costs as determined by the Commission and developed pursuant to chapters 20:10:28 and 20:10:29, including a commission-approved return on investment. The evaluation of costs described in the Commission's Administrative Rules involves a complicated process of cost separation and allocation. The books of record for rate-of-return companies have traditionally used the Uniform System of Accounts. NVC utilizes Generally Accepted Accounting Principles and allocations necessary to complete an intrastate cost study consistent with the commission's rules would be difficult to obtain.

# 2. NVC Does Not Have the Managerial Resources or Need to Conduct Cost Studies

NVC is a small competitive local exchange carrier that is still competing to grow its market share. Unlike regulated rate-of-return carriers, NVC does not have the staff to form an entire department dedicated to preparing cost studies. NVC does not have the staff or the expertise to fully perform the separations and allocations contemplated in chapters 20:10:28 and 20:10:29. NVC is not a regulated rate-of-return company and has never had a reason to evaluate its costs in the same manner.

# 3. The Costs Associated With Developing Company-Specific Cost-Based Intrastate Switched Access Rates Outweigh Potential Benefits to the Consumer

There is no correlating benefit to the consumer in requiring NVC to file company-specific cost-based intrastate switched access rates. In fact, the converse is likely true. Requiring NVC to file company-specific cost-based intrastate

switched access rates would result in unnecessary operating costs that would eventually be passed on to consumers in the form of higher consumer rates. Furthermore, to date the Commission has not required any competitive local exchange carriers (CLEC's) to file company-specific cost-based intrastate switched access rates. NVC is still an immature company with high startup costs. Any determination of cost-based intrastate access rates would result in an artificially high rate inconsistent with the costs of a mature network. The Commission's policy to allow maturing CLEC's to seek exemptions from filing high access rates keeps access rates low and serves the public interest.

WHEREFORE, for the reasons stated above NVC respectfully requests that the Commission grant it an exemption from filing company-specific cost-based intrastate switched access rates.

Respectfully submitted this 29th day of November, 2005.

BANTZ, GOSCH & CREMER, L.L.C.

James M. Cremer

Attorney for Northern Valley

Communications, L.L.C.

305 6th Avenue SE

P.O. Box 970

Aberdeen, SD 57402-0970

(605) 225-2232

email: jcremer@bantzlaw.com

NVC\PUC Cost Study\Access Rate Exemption Petition 2005-11-29