RW/KC/ HB/MY/	DJ	! KS	TC 01-16
		IN THE MATTER OF THE ANALYSIS OF QWEST CORPORATION'S COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 271(C) OF THE TELECOMMUNICATIONS ACT OF 1996	DOCKET NO.
		23e · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	P	Public Utilities Commission of the Sta	ate of South Dakota
DATE		MEMORANDA	
Canta	na	of from clased docket which	has been misrafilmed.
10/310	13	Splanission of OP-5(A) for Ince	lusion in the GPAP;
13/17	23	Order leppracing Recisions to OPA	P;
12/17	23,	Wacket Clased.	
	,		
		·	
	,		
•			
		·	
	·		
		·	
	·····	· .	

MS COLLEEN SEVOLD
MANAGER-REGULATORY AFFAIRS
QWEST CORPORATION
125 SOUTH DAKOTA AVENUE 8TH FLOOR
SIOUX FALLS SD 57194

MR THOMAS J WELK ATTORNEY AT LAW BOYCE MURPHY MCDOWELL & GREENFIELD PO BOX 5015 SIOUX FALLS SD 57117-5015

MS MARY S HOBSON ATTORNEY AT LAW STOEL RIVES LLP 101 SOUTH CAPITOL BLVD SUITE 1900 BOISE ID 83702-5958

MR JOHN L MUNN ATTORNEY AT LAW QWEST CORPORATION 1801 CALIFORNIA STREET SUITE 4900 DENVER CO 80202

MR TED SMITH
ATTORNEY AT LAW
QWEST CORPORATION
ONE UTAH CENTER SUITE 1100
201 SOUTH MAIN STREET
SALT LAKE CITY UT 84111

MR LINDEN R EVANS ATTORNEY AT LAW BLACK HILLS CORPORATION PO BOX 1400 RAPID CITY SD 57709

MR DAVID A GERDES
MR. BRETT KOENECKE
ATTORNEYS AT LAW
MAY ADAM GERDES & THOMPSON LLP
PO BOX 160
PIERRE SD 57501-0160

MR STEVEN H WEIGLER MS MARY B TRIBBY ATTORNEYS AT LAW AT&T COMMUNICATIONS OF THE MIDWEST INC. 1875 LAWRENCE STREET SUITE 1524 DENVER CO 80202

MR JOHN S LOVALD ATTORNEY AT LAW OLINGER LOVALD ROBBENNOLT & MCCAHREN PO BOX 66 PIERRE SD 57501-0066

MR WARREN R FISCHER SENIOR CONSULTANT **QSI CONSULTING** 2500 CHERRY CREEK DRIVE SOUTH SUITE 319 DENVER CO 80209

MR MARK STACY **QSI CONSULTING** 5300 MEADOWBROOK DRIVE CHEYENNE WY 82009

MS LYNN A STANG **QWEST CORPORATION** 1801 CALIFORNIA STREET SUITE 4900 DENVER CO 80202

MS JOANNE RAGGE QWEST CORPORATION 1801 CALIFORNIA STREET SUITE 4900 DENVER CO 80202

MR DANIEL WAGGONER ATTORNEY AT LAW DAVIS WRIGHT TREMAINE LLP 2600 CENTURY SQUARE 1501 FOURTH AVENUE SEATTLE WA 98710

forf 303-896-8120 forf 206-346-5715

MS SUSAN CALLAGHAN SENIOR COUNSEL TOUCH AMERICA INC 130 NORTH MAIN STREET BUTTE MT 59701



Docket TC01-165

Dear Ms. Bonrud:

Timothy J. Goodwin
Senior Attorney
1801 California
Suite 4700
Denver, CO 80202
303-896-9874

303-896-8120 (fax) tim.qoodwin@gwest.com

October 31, 2003

Pamela Bonrud Executive Director Public Utilities Commission of the State of South Dakota 500 East Capitol Avenue Pierre, SD 57501 VIA OVERNIGHT UPS

RECEWED

NOV 0 3 2003

the second secon

SOUTH DAKOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

I attach the original and ten copies of Qwest's Submission Of OP-5(A) For Inclusion In The QPAP for filing. Please file this submission and return a file-stamped copy to me via the enclosed self-addressed, postage paid envelope.

Sincerely,

Timoth∖y J. G∕oodwin

enclosures

Re:

Elec Reid 10/31/03

PECEVED

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA

NOV 0 3 2003 SOUTH DAKOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF THE ANALYSIS OF QWEST CORPORATION'S COMPLIANCE WITH SECTION 271(C) OF THE TELECOMMUNICATIONS ACT OF 1996 TC 01-165

Submission Of OP-5(A) For Inclusion In The QPAP

Qwest Corporation ("Qwest") submits this filing of its revised Qwest Performance Plan ("QPAP") for South Dakota to modify the QPAP to reflect agreed-to changes, stemming from the Long Term PID Administration ("LTPA"). Attached to this notice is a red-lined and clean version of the revised QPAP.¹ In support of this notice and motion for approval Qwest states as follows:

- 1. Exhibit B to the SGAT, Service Performance Indicator Definitions ("PIDs"), Version 5.0, was updated with Version 5.0(a) pursuant to Section 20 of the SGAT. This revised version of the PIDs was filed with this Commission on or about October 2, 2003 (Docket TC03-184). Version 5.0(a) reflected the modification of OP-5 pursuant to agreement reached in the LTPA.
- 2. The modifications to OP-5 were negotiated and agreed to with participating CLECs and State Commission State Staffs in the LTPA collaborative forum. Discussions began in December, 2002. After 8 months and approximately 22 conference calls, unanimous agreement was reached on August 6, 2003, resulting in a revised OP-5 now entitled "New Service Quality".² The revised OP-5 includes four sub-

¹ The QPAP can also be found as Exhibit K to the SGAT.

² The existing OP-5 is titled "New Service Installation Quality".

measures, A, B, T and R. Similar to the previous OP-5, sub-measure A to the revised OP-5 measures the percentage of repair trouble reports, but with more exacting matches of trouble reports to service orders. Specifically, the reporting of the measurement changed from reporting a rolling two-month average of results to the new method where each month is now reported separately, one month in arrears. This change allows any trouble reports that occur within thirty (30) days of completion of the service order to be matched with the original service order and to be reported in a more timely fashion.

The additional sub-measures (OP-5B, T and R) are diagnostic and focus on provisioning trouble reports, repair trouble reports or both on a combined basis.

Because these new sub-measures are diagnostic, they do not affect the PAP.

- 3. With this filing and pursuant to section 16 of the Qwest Performance Assurance Plan (QPAP), Qwest has modified Exhibit K, Attachment 1, to reflect the change from OP-5 to OP-5A. The new OP-5A measurement will become effective beginning with November 2003 data, reported in January, 2004. Attached are a red-lined Exhibit K and a clean Exhibit K for the convenience of the Commission.
- 4. By making this filing in Docket TC01-165, Qwest requests that the Commission approve Exhibit K, as revised and modified, and make it effective no later than December 1, 2003, and that pursuant to section 16, the changes shall automatically apply to all existing interconnection agreements that currently contain Exhibit K, the QPAP, as an exhibit.

Dated: October 31, 2003.

Tim Goodwin

QWEST SERVICES CORPORATION 1801 California Street 47th floor Denver, CO 80202

ATTORNEYS FOR QWEST CORPORATION

PERFORMANCE ASSURANCE PLAN

RECEIVED

NOV 0 3 2003

1.0 Introduction

SOUTH DAKOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

1.1 As set forth in this Agreement, Qwest and CLEC voluntarily agree to the terms of the following Performance Assurance Plan ("PAP"), prepared in conjunction with Qwest's application for approval under Section 271 of the Telecommunications Act of 1996 (the "Act") to offer in-region long distance service.

2.0 Plan Structure

- 2.1 The PAP is a two-tiered, self-executing remedy plan. CLEC shall be provided with Tier 1 payments if, as applicable, Qwest does not provide parity between the service it provides to CLEC and that which it provides to its own retail customers, or Qwest fails to meet applicable benchmarks.
- 2.1.1 As specified in section 7.0, if Qwest fails to meet parity and benchmark standards on an aggregate CLEC basis, Qwest shall make Tier 2 payments to a Fund administered by the state regulatory commission or, if required by existing law, to the state general fund.
- 2.2 As specified in sections 6.0 and 7.0 and Attachments 1 and 2, payment is generally on a per occurrence basis, (i.e., a set dollar payment times the number of non-conforming service events). For the performance measurements which do not lend themselves to per occurrence payment, payment is on a per measurement basis, (i.e., a set dollar payment). The level of payment also depends upon the number of consecutive months of non-conforming performance, (i.e., an escalating payment the longer the duration of non-conforming performance).
- 2.3 Qwest shall be in conformance with the parity standard when service Qwest provides to CLEC is equivalent to that which it provides meet the benchmark. Percentage benchmarks will be adjusted to round the allowable number of misses up or down to the closest integer, except when a benchmark standard and low CLEC volume are such that a 100% performance result would be required to meet the standard and has not been attained. In such a situation, the determination of whether Qwest meets or fails the benchmark standard will be made using performance results for the month in question, plus a sufficient number of consecutive months so that a 100% performance result would not be required to meet the standard. For purposes of section 6.2, a meet or fail determined by this procedure shall count as a single month to its retail customers. The PAP relies upon statistical scoring to determine whether any difference between CLEC and Qwest performance results is significant, that is, not attributable to simple random variation. Statistical parity shall exist when performance results for CLEC and for Qwest retail

analogue result in a z-value that is no greater than the critical z-values listed in the Critical Z-Statistical Table in section 5.0

For performance measurements that have no Qwest retail analogue, agreed upon benchmarks shall be used. Benchmarks shall be evaluated using a "stare and compare" method. For example, if the benchmark is for a particular performance measurement is 95% or better, Qwest performance results must be at least 95% to

3.0 **Performance Measurements**

The performance measurements included in the PAP are set forth in 3.1 Each performance measurement identified is defined in the Attachment 1. Performance Indicator Definitions ("PIDs") developed in the ROC Operational Support System ("OSS") collaborative, and which are included in the SGAT at Exhibit B. The measurements have been designated as Tier 1, Tier 2, or both Tier 1 and Tier 2 and given a High, Medium, or Low designation.

Statistical Measurement 4.0

- Qwest uses a statistical test, namely the modified "z-test," for evaluating the 4.1 difference between two means (i.e., Qwest and CLEC service or repair intervals) or two percentages (e.g., Qwest and CLEC proportions), to determine whether a parity condition exists between the results for Qwest and the CLEC(s). The modified ztests shall be applicable if the number of data points are greater than 30 for a given measurement. For testing measurements for which the number of data points are 30 or less. Qwest will use a permutation test to determine the statistical significance of the difference between Qwest and CLEC.
- Qwest shall be in conformance when the monthly performance results for 4.2 parity measurements (whether in the form of means, percents, or proportions and at the equivalent level of disaggregation) are such that the calculated z-test statistics are not greater than the critical z-values as listed in Table 1, section 5.0.
- Qwest shall be in conformance with benchmark measurements when the 4.3 monthly performance result equals or exceeds the benchmark, if a higher value means better performance, and when the monthly performance result equals or is less than the benchmark if a lower value means better performance.

The formula for determining parity using the modified z-test is:

$$z = DIFF / \sigma_{DIFF}$$

Where:

 $DIFF = M_{Owest} - M_{CLEC}$

Fxhibit K

 M_{OWEST} = Qwest average or proportion

 $M_{CLEC} = CLEC$ average or proportion

 $\sigma_{DIFF} = \text{square root } \Box \sigma^{\Box} Q \text{west } (1/n_{CLEC} + 1/n_{Qwest})]$

 σ^2_{Owest} = calculated variance for Qwest

 n_{Qwest} = number of observations or samples used in Qwest measurement

n_{CLEC} = number of observations or samples used in CLEC measurement

The modified z-tests will be applied to reported parity measurements that contain more than 30 data points.

In calculating the difference between Qwest and CLEC performance, the above formula applies when a larger Qwest value indicates a better level of performance. In cases where a smaller Qwest value indicates a higher level of performance, the order is reversed, i.e., M_{CLEC} - M_{QWEST}.

4.3.1 For parity measurements where the number of data points is 30 or less, Qwest will apply a permutation test to test for statistical significance. Permutation analysis will be applied to calculate the z-statistic using the following logic:

Calculate the modified z-statistic for the actual arrangement of the data Pool and mix the CLEC and Qwest data sets Perform the following 1000 times:

Randomly subdivide the pooled data sets into two pools, one the same size as the original CLEC data set (n_{CLEC}) and one reflecting the remaining data points, and one reflecting the remaining data points, (which is equal to the size of the original Qwest data set or nowest).

Compute and store the modified z-test score (Z_s) for this sample.

Count the number of times the z-statistic for a permutation of the data is greater than the actual modified z- statistic

Compute the fraction of permutations for which the statistic for the rearranged data is greater than the statistic for the actual samples

If the fraction is greater than α , the significance level of the test, the hypothesis of no difference is not rejected, and the test is passed. The α shall be .05 when the critical z value is 1.645 and .15 when the critical z value is 1.04.

5.0 Critical Z-Value

5.1 The following table shall be used to determine the critical z-value that is referred to in section 6.0. It is based on the monthly business volume of the CLEC for the particular performance measurements for which statistic testing is being performed.

TABLE 1: CRITICAL Z-VALUE

CLEC volume	LIS Trunks, UDITs,	All Other
(Sample size)	Resale, UBL-DS1 and	
	DS-3	·
1-10	1.04*	1.645
11-150	1.645	1.645
151-300	2.0	2.0
301-600	2.7	2.7
601-3000	3.7	3.7
3001 and above	4.3	4.3

^{*} The 1.04 applies for individual month testing for performance measurements involving LIS trunks and DS-1 and DS-3 that are UDITs, Resale, or Unbundled Loops. The performance measurements are OP-3d/e, OP-4d/e, OP-5a, OP-6-4/5, MR-5a/b, MR-7d/e, and MR-8.

For purposes of determining consecutive month misses, 1.645 shall be used. Where performance measurements disaggregate to zone 1 and zone 2, the zones shall be combined for purposes of statistical testing.

6.0 Tier 1 Payments to CLEC

- 6.1 Tier 1 payments to CLEC shall be made solely for the performance measurements designated as Tier 1 on Attachment 1. The payment amount for non-conforming service varies depending upon the designation of performance measurements as High, Medium, and Low and the duration of the non-conforming service condition as described below. Non-conforming service is defined in section 4.0.
- 6.1.1 Determination of Non-Conforming Measurements: The number of performance measurements that are determined to be non-conforming and, therefore, eligible for Tier 1 payments, are limited according to the critical z-value shown in Table 1, section 5.0. The critical z-values are the statistical standard that determines for each CLEC performance measurement whether Qwest has met parity. The critical z-value is selected from Table 1 according to the monthly CLEC volume for the performance measurement. For instance, if the CLEC sample size for

that month is 100, the critical z-value is 1.645 for the statistical testing of that parity performance measurement.

- 6.2 Determination of the Amount of Payment: Tier 1 payments to CLEC, except as provided for in sections 6.3 and 10.0, are calculated and paid monthly based on the number of performance measurements exceeding the critical z-value. Payments will be made on either a per occurrence or per measurement basis, depending upon the performance measurement, using the dollar amounts specified in Table 2 below. The dollar amounts vary depending upon whether the performance measurement is designated High, Medium, or Low and escalate depending upon the number of consecutive months for which Qwest has not met the standard for the particular measurement.
- 6.2.1 The escalation of payments for consecutive months of non-conforming service will be matched month for month with de-escalation of payments for every month of conforming service. For example, if Qwest has four consecutive monthly "misses" it will make payments that escalate from month 1 to month 4 as shown in Table 2. If, in the next month, service meets the standard, Qwest makes no payment. A payment "indicator" de-escalates down from month 4 to month 3. If Qwest misses the following month, it will make payment at the month 3 level of Table 2 because that is where the payment "indicator" presently sits. If Qwest misses again the following month, it will make payments that escalate back to the month 4 level. The payment level will de-escalate back to the original month 1 level only upon conforming service sufficient to move the payment "indicator" back to the month 1 level.
- 6.2.2 For those performance measurements listed on Attachment 2 as "Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Caps," payment to a CLEC in a single month shall not exceed the amount listed in Table 2 below for the "Per Measurement" category. For those performance measurements listed on Attachment 2 as "Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Payments," payment to a CLEC will be the amount set forth in Table 2 below under the section labeled "per measurement."

TABLE 2: TIER-1 PAYMENTS TO CLEC

Per Occurrence							
Measurement Group	Month 1	Month 2	Month 3	Month 4	Month 5	Month 6	Each following month after Month 6 add
High	\$150	\$250	\$500	\$600	\$700	\$800	\$100
Medium	\$ 75	\$150	\$300	\$400	\$500	\$600	\$100
Low	\$ 25	\$ 50	\$100	\$200	\$300	\$400	\$100

Per Measurement Cap				·			
Measurement Group	Month 1	Month 2	Month 3	Month 4	Month 5	Month 6	Each following month after Month 6 add
High	\$25,000	\$50,00 0	\$75,00 0	\$100,00 0	\$125,00 0	\$150,000	\$25,000
Medium	\$10,000	\$20,00 0	\$30,00 0	\$ 40,000	\$ 50,000	\$ 60,000	\$ 10,000
Low	\$ 5,000	\$10,00 0	\$15,00 0	\$ 20,000	\$ 25,000	\$ 30,000	\$ 5,000

6.3 For collocation, CP-2 and CP-4 performance measurements shall be relied upon for delineation of collocation business rules. For purposes of calculating Tier 1 payments, collocation jobs and collocation feasibility studies that are later than the due date will have a per day payment applied according to Table 3. The per day payment will be applied to any collocation job in which the feasibility study is provided or the collocation installation is completed later than the scheduled date. The calculation of the payment amount will be performed by applying the per day payment amounts as specified in Table 3. Thus, for days 1 through 10, the payment is \$150 per day. For days 11 through 20, the payment is \$300 per day and so on.

TABLE 3: TIER-1 COLLOCATION PAYMENTS TO CLECS

Days Late	Completion Date	Feasibility Study
1 to 10 days	\$150/day	\$45/day
11 to 20 days	\$300/day	\$90/day
21 to 30 days	\$450/day	\$135/day
31 to 40 days	\$600/day	\$180/day
More than 40 days	\$1,000/day	\$300/day

6.4 A minimum payment calculation shall be performed at the end of each year for each CLEC with annual order volumes of no more than 1,200. The payment shall be calculated by multiplying \$2,000 by the number of months in which at least one payment was made to the CLEC. To the extent that the actual CLEC payment for the year is less than the product of the preceding calculation, Qwest shall make an additional payment equal to the difference.

7.0 Tier 2 Payments to the State

7.1 Payments to the State shall be limited to the performance measurements designated in section 7.4 for Tier 2 per measurement payments and in Attachment 1 for per occurrence payments and which have at least 10 data points each month for

the period payments are being calculated. Similar to the Tier 1 structure, Tier 2 measurements are categorized as High, Medium, and Low and the amount of payments for non-conformance varies according to this categorization.

- Determination of Non-Conforming Measurements: The determination of non-7.2 conformance will be based upon the aggregate of all CLEC data for each Tier 2 performance measurement. Non-conforming service is defined in section 4.2 (for parity measurements) and 4.3 (for benchmark measurements), except that a 1.645 critical z-value shall be used for all parity measurements but MR-2 and OP-2. The critical z-value is the statistical standard that determines for each performance measurement whether Qwest has met parity.
- Determination of the Amount of Payment: Except as provided in section 7.4. 7.3 Tier 2 payments are calculated and paid monthly based on the number of performance measurements exceeding the critical z-value, identified in section 7.2, in Payment will be made on either a per occurrence or per measurement basis, whichever is applicable to the performance measurement, using the dollar amounts specified in Table 4 or Table 5 below. Except as provided in section 7.4, the dollar amounts vary depending upon whether the performance measurement is designated High, Medium, or Low.
- For those Tier 2 measurements listed on Attachment 2 as "Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Caps," payment to the State in a single month shall not exceed the amount listed in Table 4 for the "Per Measurement" category.

TABLE 4: TIER-2 PAYMENTS TO STATE FUNDS

Per Occurrence

Measurement Group	
High	
	\$500
Medium	
	\$300
Low	
	\$200

Per Measurement/Cap

Measurement Group	
High	\$75,000
Medium	\$30,000
Low	\$20,000

Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Payment: The following Tier 2 performance measurements shall have their performance results measured on a region-wide (14 state) basis. Failure to meet the performance standard, therefore, will result in a per measurement payment in each of the Qwest in-region 14 states adopting this PAP. The performance measurements are:

GA-1: Gateway Availability - IMA-GUI

GA-2: Gateway Availability - IMA-EDI

GA-3: Gateway Availability – EB-TA GA-4: System Availability – EXACT

GA-6: Gateway Availability – GUI-Repair PO-1: Pre-Order/Order Response Times

OP-2: Call Answered within Twenty Seconds - Interconnect Provisioning

Center

MR-2: Calls Answered within Twenty Seconds – Interconnect Repair Center

PO-20: Manual Service Order Accuracy

GA-1 has three sub-measurements: GA-1A, GA-1B, and GA-1C. PO-1 shall have two sub-measurements: PO-1A and PO-1B. PO-1A and PO-1B shall have their transaction types aggregated together. PO-20 shall have two product disaggregations – Resale POTS / UNE-P (POTS) and Unbundled Loops (Analog and Non-Loaded 2-Wire).

For these measurements, Qwest will make a Tier 2 payment based upon monthly performance results according to Table 5: Tier 2 Per Measurement Payments to State Funds.

TABLE 5: TIER-2 PER MEASUREMENT PAYMENTS TO STATE FUNDS

Measurement Performance		State	14 State
		Payment	Payment
GA-1,2,3,4,6	1% or lower	\$1,000	\$14,000
	>1% to 3%	\$10,000	\$140,000
	>3% to 5%	\$20,000	\$280,000
	>5%	\$30,000	\$420,000
PO-1	2 sec. Or less	\$1,000	\$14,000
	>2 sec. to 5	\$5,000	\$70,000
	sec.		
	>5 sec. to 10	\$10,000	\$140,000
	sec.		
	>10 sec.	\$15,000	\$210,000
		·	,
OP-2/MR-2	1% or lower	\$1,000	\$14,000
	>1% to 3%	\$5,000	\$70,000
	>3% to 5%	\$10,000	\$140,000
	>5%	\$15,000	\$210,000
•			
PO-20			
- Resale POTS /	1% or lower	\$500	\$7,000
UNE-P (POTS)	>1% to 3%	\$2,500	\$35,000

	>3% to 5%	\$5,000	\$70,000
	>5%	\$7,500	\$105,000
- Unbundled Loops	1% or lower	\$500	\$7,000
(Analog and 2-	>1% to 3%	\$2,500	\$35,000
Wire			
Non-Loaded)	>3% to 5%	\$5,000	\$70,000
	>5%	\$7,500	\$105,000

7.5 Payment of Tier 2 Funds: Payments to a state fund shall be used for any purpose determined by the Commission that is allowed to it by state law. If the Commission is not permitted by state law to receive or administer Tier 2 payments, payments shall be made to the state general fund or to such other source as may be provided for under state law.

8.0 Step by Step Calculation of Monthly Tier 1 Payments to CLEC

- 8.1 Application of the Critical Z-Values: Qwest shall identify the Tier 1 parity performance measurements that measure the service provided to CLEC by Qwest for the month in question and the critical z-value from Table 1 in section 5.0 that shall be used for purposes of statistical testing for each particular performance measurement. The statistical testing procedures described in section 4.0 shall be applied. For the purpose of determining the critical z-values, each disaggregated category of a performance measurement is treated as a separate sub-measurement. The critical z-value to be applied is determined by the CLEC volume at each level of disaggregation or sub-measurement.
- 8.2 Performance Measurements for which Tier 1 Payment is Per Occurrence:
- 8.2.1 Performance Measurements that are Averages or Means:
- 8.2.1.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the average or the mean that would yield the critical z-value shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 8.2.1.2 Step 2: The percentage differences between the actual averages and the calculated averages shall be calculated. The calculation is % diff = (CLEC result Calculated Value)/Calculated Value.
- 8.2.1.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the percentage calculated in the previous step and the per occurrence dollar amounts from the Tier 1 Payment Table shall determine the payment to the CLEC for each non-conforming performance measurement.

- 8.2.2 Performance Measurements that are Percentages:
- 8.2.2.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the percentage that would yield the critical z-value shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z- statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 8.2.2.2 Step 2: The difference between the actual percentages for the CLEC and the calculated percentages shall be determined.
- 8.2.2.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the difference in percentage calculated in the previous step, and the per occurrence dollar amount taken from the Tier 1 Payment Table, to determine the payment to the CLEC for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- 8.2.3 Performance Measurements that are Ratios or Proportions:
- 8.2.3.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement the ratio that would yield the critical z-value shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 8.2.3.2 Step 2: The absolute difference between the actual rate for the CLEC and the calculated rate shall be determined.
- 8.2.3.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the difference calculated in the previous step, and the per occurrence dollar amount taken from the Tier 1 Payment Table, to determine the payment to the CLEC for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- Performance Measurements for which Tier 1 Payment is Per Measure: 8.3
- For each performance measurement where Qwest fails to meet the standard, the payment to the CLEC shall be the dollar amount shown on the "per measure" portion of Table 2: Tier 1 Payments to CLEC.
- Step by Step Calculation of Monthly Tier 2 Payments to State Funds 9.0
- Application of the Critical Z-Values: Qwest shall identify the Tier 2 parity performance measurements that measure the service provided to all CLECs by Qwest for the month in question. The statistical testing procedures described in section 4.0 shall be applied, except that a 1.645 critical z-value shall be used for all parity measurements except MR-2 and OP-2. If Qwest misses a performance

standard and there are at least 10 data points for the performance measurement, a Tier 2 payment will be calculated and paid as described below and will continue in each succeeding month until Qwest's performance meets the applicable standard.

- 9.2 Performance Measurements for which Tier 2 Payment is Per Occurrence:
- 9.2.1 Performance Measurements that are Averages or Means:
- 9.2.1.1 Step 1: The monthly average or the mean for each performance measurement that would yield the critical z-value for each month shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 9.2.1.2 Step 2: The percentage difference between the actual averages and the calculated averages for each month shall be calculated. The calculation for parity measurements is % diff = (actual average calculated average)/calculated average.
- 9.2.1.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points for the non-conforming month shall be multiplied by the percentage calculated in the previous step and multiplied by the result of the per occurrence dollar amount taken from the Tier 2 Payment Table to determine the payment to the State for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- 9.3 Performance Measurements that are Percentages:
- 9.3.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the monthly percentage that would yield the critical z-value for each month shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 9.3.1.2 Step 2: The difference between the actual percentages and the calculated percentages for the non-conforming month shall be calculated. The calculation for parity measurement is diff = (CLEC result calculated percentage). This formula shall be applicable where a high value is indicative of poor performance. The formula shall be reversed where high performance is indicative of good performance.
- 9.3.1.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points for the non-conforming month shall be multiplied by the difference in percentage calculated in the previous step and multiplied by the result of the per occurrence dollar amounts taken from the Tier 2 Payment Table to determine the payment to the State.

- 9.4 Performance Measurements that are Ratios or Proportions:
- 9.4.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the ratio that would yield the critical z-value for each month shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 9.4.1.1 Step 2: The difference between the actual rate for the CLEC and the calculated rate for the non-conforming month shall be calculated. The calculation is: diff = (CLEC rate calculated rate). This formula shall apply where a high value is indicative of poor performance. The formula shall be reversed where high performance is indicative of good performance.
- 9.4.1.2 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the difference calculated in the previous step for the non-conforming month and multiplied by the result of the per occurrence dollar amounts taken from the Tier 2 Payment Table to determine the payment to the State.
- 9.5 Performance Measurements for which Tier 2 Payment is Per Measure:
- 9.5.1 For each performance measurement where Qwest fails to meet the standard, the payment to the State Fund shall be the dollar amount shown on the "per measure" portion of the Tier 2 Payment Table.

10.0 Low Volume, Developing Markets

- 10.1 For certain qualifying performance standards, if the aggregate monthly volumes of CLECs participating in the PAP are more than 10, but less than 100, Qwest will make Tier 1 payments to CLECs for failure to meet the parity or benchmark standard for the qualifying performance sub-measurements. The qualifying sub-measurements are the UNE-P (POTS), megabit resale, and ADSL qualified loop product disaggregation of OP-3, OP-4, OP-5a, MR-3, MR-5, MR-7, and MR-8. If the aggregate monthly CLEC volume is greater than 100, the provisions of this section shall not apply to the qualifying performance sub-measurement.
- 10.2 The determination of whether Qwest has met the parity or benchmark standards will be made using aggregate volumes of CLECs participating in the PAP. In the event Qwest does not meet the applicable performance standards, a total payment to affected CLECs will be determined in accordance with the high, medium, low designation for each performance measurement (see Attachment 1) and as described in section 8.0, except that CLEC aggregate volumes will be used. In the event the calculated total payment amount to CLECs is less than \$5,000, a minimum payment of \$5,000 shall be made. The resulting total payment amount to CLECs will

be apportioned to the affected CLECs based upon each CLEC's relative share of the number of total service misses.

At the six (6)-month reviews, Qwest will consider adding to the above list of sub-measurements. performance new products disaggregation representing new modes of CLEC entry into developing markets.

11.0 **Payment**

- Payments to CLEC, the State, or the Special Fund shall be made one month 11.1 following the due date of the performance measurement report for the month for which payment is being made. Qwest will pay interest on any late payment and underpayment at the prime rate as reported in the Wall Street Journal. On any overpayment. Qwest is allowed to offset future payments by the amount of the overpayment plus interest at the prime rate.
- Payment to CLEC shall be made via bill credits. Bill credits shall be identified 11.2 on a summary format substantially similar to that distributed as a prototype to the CLECs and the Commissions. To the extent that a monthly payment owed to CLEC under this PAP exceeds the amount owed to Qwest by CLEC on a monthly bill, Qwest will issue a check or wire transfer to CLEC in the amount of the overage. Payment to the State shall be made via check or wire transfer.
- Upon the execution of a memorandum of understanding with the South 11.3 Dakota Commission, a South Dakota Special Fund and a South Dakota Discretionary Fund shall be created for the purposes and in accordance with section 11.0. The South Dakota Commission shall authorize disbursement of funds. All claims against the funds shall be presented to the Commission and shall be the responsibility of the South Dakota Commission.
- 11.3.1. Qwest shall establish the South Dakota Special Fund and the South Dakota Discretionary Fund as separate interest bearing escrow accounts. Upon Qwest receiving effective section 271 authority from the FCC for the state of South Dakota, the Commission shall determine and direct Qwest to deposit into the South Dakota Special Fund either 1) one-fifth of all Tier 1 payments that exceed the month 1 payment amounts in Table 2 and one-third of all Tier 2 payments or 2) 50% of all Tier 2 payments. Qwest shall deposit any other Tier 2 payments into the South Dakota Discretionary Fund. The costs of the escrow accounts will be paid for from the accounts' funds.
- 11.3.2 The South Dakota Special Fund shall be created to pay the independent auditor and audit costs for the purpose of regional or state audits as specified in section 15.1 or, and to pay expenses incurred by the Commission in participating in any regional review of the PIDs. Disbursements from the South Dakota Special Fund

shall first be from Tier 2 funds and second from Tier 1 funds. Not less than every two years. Tier 1 funds that are not needed to meet the continuing obligations of the Special Fund shall be returned on a pro-rata basis to CLECs, including any interest not used for fund administration. Other than the transfer of funds allowed in section 11.3.2.1, disbursements from the South Dakota Discretionary Fund shall be for, but not limited to, South Dakota telecommunications initiatives. Any excess funds in the South Dakota Special Fund may be transferred to the South Dakota Discretionary Fund at the Commission's discretion.

- 11.3.2.1 If the South Dakota Commission chooses not to participate in the regional audit pursuant to section 15.1 and the account balance of the South Dakota Special Fund escrow account is less than \$50,000 at the time of any state audit described in section 15.1, a transfer of funds from the South Dakota Discretionary Fund to the South Dakota Special Fund shall be allowed in the amount necessary to bring the South Dakota Special Fund balance to \$50,000.
- 11.3.3 Notwithstanding the provisions herein, Qwest shall advance sufficient funds to any consolidated Special Fund established by participating states, set up for the purpose of a regional audit as specified in sections 15.1, not to exceed \$200,000 (or \$500,000 in the event 6 or more states participate in the regional audit) in order to meet initial claims against that Fund to the extent that contributions from Tier 1 and/or Tier 2 payments are insufficient. Qwest shall be allowed to recover any such advances plus interest at the rate that such an escrow account would have earned from future Tier 2 payments.

12.0 Cap on Tier 1 and Tier 2 Payments

- There shall be a cap on the total payments made by Qwest for a 12-month 12.1 period beginning with the effective date of the PAP for the State of South Dakota. The annual cap for the State of South Dakota shall be 36% of the prior year's ARMIS Net Return, or \$15,000,000, whichever is greater, subject to any applicable adjustments permitted pursuant to section 12.2. Qwest shall submit to the Commission the calculation of each year's cap no later than 30 days after submission of ARMIS results to the FCC. CLEC agrees that this amount constitutes a maximum annual cap that shall apply to the aggregate total of Tier 1 liquidated damages, including any such damages paid pursuant to this Agreement, any other interconnection agreement, or any other payments made for the same underlying activity or omission under any other contract, order or rule and Tier 2 assessments or payments made by Qwest for the same underlying activity or omission under any other contract, order or rule.
- If Qwest payments equal or exceed the annual cap for two years in a row or equal or exceed 1/3rd of the annual cap in a combination of two consecutive months, the Commission shall have the authority to open a proceeding to request Qwest to explain the non-conforming performance and show that it did not result from Qwest's failure to act in a prudent manner to avoid reasonably foreseeable consequences.

The Commission may raise the cap to the amount which Qwest would have paid in the higher of the prior two years, may ask the Federal Communication Commission ("FCC") to halt Qwest's in-region interLATA long distance marketing authority for a particular interval, or may take other appropriate action.

- 12.3 If the annual cap is reached, each CLEC shall, as of the end of the plan year, be entitled to receive the same percentage of its total calculated Tier 1 payments. In order to preserve the operation of the annual cap, the percentage of equalization shall take place as follows:
- 12.3.1 The amount by which any month's total year-to-date Tier 1 and Tier 2 payments exceeds the cumulative monthly cap (defined as 1/12th of the annual cap times the cumulative number of months to date) shall be calculated and apportioned between Tier 1 and Tier 2 according to the percentage that each bore of total payments for the year-to-date. The Tier 1 apportionment resulting of this calculation shall be known as the "Tracking Account."
- 12.3.2 The Tier 1 apportionment shall be debited against the monthly payment due to each CLEC, by applying to the year-to-date payments received by each the percentage necessary to generate the required total Tier 1 amount.
- 12.3.3 The Tracking Amount shall be apportioned among all CLECs so as to provide each with payments equal in percentage of its total year to date Tier 1 payment calculations.
- 12.3.4 This calculation shall take place in the first month that the year-to-date total Tier 1 and Tier 2 payments are expected to exceed the cumulative monthly cap and for each month of that year thereafter. Qwest shall recover any debited amounts by reducing payments due to any CLEC for that month and any succeeding months, as necessary.

13.0 Limitations

- 13.1 The PAP shall not become available in the State unless and until Qwest receives effective section 271 authority from the FCC for that State.
- 13.2 Qwest will not be liable for Tier 1 payments to CLEC in an FCC approved state until the Commission has approved an interconnection agreement between CLEC and Qwest which adopts the provisions of this PAP.
- 13.3 Qwest shall not be obligated to make Tier 1 or Tier 2 payments for any measurement if and to the extent that non-conformance for that measurement was the result of any of the following: 1) with respect to performance measurements with a benchmark standard, a Force Majeure event as defined in section 5.7 of the SGAT. Qwest will provide notice of the occurrence of a Force Majeure event within 72 hours

of the time Qwest learns of the event or within a reasonable time frame that Qwest should have learned of it; 2) an act or omission by a CLEC that is contrary to any of its obligations under its interconnection agreement with Qwest or under federal or state law: an act or omission by CLEC that is in bad faith. Examples of bad faith conduct include, but are not limited to: unreasonably holding service orders and/or applications, "dumping" orders or applications in unreasonably large batches. "dumping" orders or applications at or near the close of a business day, on a Friday evening or prior to a holiday, and failing to provide timely forecasts to Qwest for services or facilities when such forecasts are explicitly required by the SGAT; 3) problems associated with third-party systems or equipment, which could not have been avoided by Qwest in the exercise of reasonable diligence, provided, however, that this third party exclusion will not be raised in the State more than three times within a calendar year. If a Force Majeure event or other excusing event recognized in this section merely suspends Qwest's ability to timely perform an activity subject to a performance measurement that is an interval measure, the applicable time frame in which Qwest's compliance with the parity or benchmark criterion is measured will be extended on an hour-for-hour or day-for-day basis, as applicable, equal to the duration of the excusing event.

- 13.3.1 Qwest will not be excused from Tier 1 or Tier 2 payments for any reason except as described in Section 13.0. Qwest will have the burden of demonstrating that its non-conformance with the performance measurement was excused on one of the grounds described in this PAP. A party may petition the Commission to require Qwest to deposit disputed payments into an escrow account when the requesting party can show cause, such as grounds provided in the Uniform Commercial Code for cases of commercial uncertainty.
- 13.3.2 Notwithstanding any other provision of this PAP, it shall not excuse performance that Qwest could reasonably have been expected to deliver assuming that it had designed, implemented, staffed, provisioned, and otherwise provided for resources reasonably required to meet foreseeable volumes and patterns of demands upon its resources by CLECs.
- 13.4 Qwest's agreement to implement these enforcement terms, and specifically its agreement to pay any "liquidated damages" or "assessments" hereunder, will not be considered as an admission against interest or an admission of liability in any legal, regulatory, or other proceeding relating in whole or in part to the same performance.
- 13.4.1 CLEC may not use: 1) the existence of this enforcement plan; or 2) Qwest's payment of Tier -1 "liquidated damages" or Tier 2 "assessments" as evidence that Qwest has discriminated in the provision of any facilities or services under Sections 251 or 252, or has violated any state or federal law or regulation. Qwest's conduct underlying its performance measures, however are not made inadmissible by its terms.

- 13.4.2 By accepting this performance remedy plan, CLEC agrees that Qwest's performance with respect to this remedy plan may not be used as an admission of liability or culpability for a violation of any state or federal law or regulation. (Nothing herein is intended to preclude Qwest from introducing evidence of any Tier 1 "liquidated damages" under these provisions for the purpose of offsetting the payment against any other damages or payments a CLEC might recover.) The terms of this paragraph do not apply to any proceeding before the Commission or the FCC to determine whether Qwest has met or continues to meet the requirements of section 271 of the Act.
- 13.5 By incorporating these liquidated damages terms into the PAP, Qwest and CLEC accepting this PAP agree that proof of damages from any non-conforming performance measurement would be difficult to ascertain and, therefore, liquidated damages are a reasonable approximation of any contractual damages that may result from a non-conforming performance measurement. Qwest and CLEC further agree that Tier 1 payments made pursuant to this PAP are not intended to be a penalty. The application of the assessments and damages provided for herein is not intended to foreclose other non-contractual legal and non-contractual regulatory claims and remedies that may be available to a CLEC.
- 13.6 This PAP contains a comprehensive set of performance measurements, statistical methodologies, and payment mechanisms that are designed to function together, and only together, as an integrated whole. To elect the PAP, CLEC must adopt the PAP in its entirety in its interconnection agreement with Qwest in lieu of other alternative standards or relief. Where alternative standards or remedies for Qwest's wholesale performance are available under rules, orders, or contracts, including interconnection agreements, CLEC will be limited to either PAP standards and remedies or the standards and remedies available under rules, orders or contracts and CLECs choice of remedies shall be specified in its interconnection agreement.
- 13.7 Any liquidated damages payment by Qwest under these provisions is not hereby made inadmissible in any proceeding related to the same conduct where Qwest seeks to offset the payments against any other damages a CLEC may recover; whether or not the nature of the damages sought by the CLEC is such that an offset is appropriate will be determined in the relevant proceeding.
- 13.8 To the extent Qwest believes that some Tier 2 payments required to be made under this PAP would duplicate payments that have been assessed by or on behalf of the Commission pursuant to any service quality rules or Commission orders, Qwest may make such Tier 2 payments to a special interest bearing escrow account and then dispute the payments before the South Dakota Commission. If Qwest can show that the payments relate to the same underlying activity or omission, it may retain the Tier 2 payments and any interest accrued on such payments.

- 13.9 Whenever a Qwest Tier 1 payment to an individual CLEC exceeds \$3 million in a month, Qwest may commence a proceeding to demonstrate why it should not be required to pay any amount in excess of the \$3 million. Upon timely commencement of the proceeding, Qwest must pay the balance of payments owed in excess of \$3 million into escrow, to be held by a third-party pending the outcome of the proceeding. To invoke these escrow provisions, Qwest must file, not later than the due date of the Tier 1 payments, its application. Qwest will have the burden of proof to demonstrate why, under the circumstances, it would be unjust to require it to make the payments in excess of \$3 million. If Qwest reports non-conforming performance to CLEC for three consecutive months on 20% or more of the measurements reported to CLEC and has incurred no more than \$1 million in liability to CLEC, then CLEC may commence a similar proceeding. In any such proceeding CLEC will have the burden of proof to demonstrate why, under the circumstances, justice requires Qwest to make payments in excess of the amount calculated pursuant to the terms of the PAP. The disputes identified in this section shall be resolved in a manner specified in the Dispute Resolution section of the SGAT with the CLEC.
- 13.10 Any payments made by Qwest as a result of the PAP should not: 1) be included as expenses in any Qwest revenue requirement, or 2) be reflected in increased rates to CLECs for services and facilities provided pursuant to Section 251(c) of the Telecommunication Act of 1996 and priced pursuant to Section 252(d) of the Telecommunications Act of 1996.
- 13.11 This Exhibit K may be assigned as a part of any agreement to which SGAT Section 5.12.1 is applicable.

14.0 Reporting

- 14.1 Upon receiving effective section 271 authority from the FCC for a state, Qwest will provide CLEC that has an approved interconnection agreement with Qwest, a monthly report of Qwest's performance for the measurements identified in the PAP by the last day of the month following the month for which performance results are being reported. However, Qwest shall have a grace period of five business days, so that Qwest shall not be deemed out of compliance with its reporting obligations before the expiration of the five business day grace period. Qwest will collect, analyze, and report performance data for the measurements listed on Attachment 1 in accordance with the most recent version of the PIDs. Upon CLEC's request, data files of the CLEC's raw data, or any subset thereof, will be transmitted, without charge, to CLEC in a mutually acceptable format, protocol, and transmission medium.
- 14.2 Qwest will also provide the Commission a monthly report of aggregate CLEC performance results pursuant to the PAP by the last day of the month following the month for which performance results are being reported. However, Qwest shall have a grace period of five business days, so that Qwest shall not be deemed out of

compliance with its reporting obligations before the expiration of the five business day grace period. Individual CLEC reports of participating CLECs will also be available to the Commission upon request. By accepting this PAP, CLEC consents to Qwest providing CLEC's report and raw data to the State Commission. Pursuant to the terms of an order of the Commission, Qwest may provide CLEC-specific data that relates to the PAP, provided that Qwest shall first initiate any procedures necessary to protect the confidentiality and to prevent the public release of the information pending any applicable Commission procedures and further provided that Qwest provides such notice as the Commission directs to the CLEC involved, in order to allow it to prosecute such procedures to their completion. Data files of participating CLEC raw data, or any subset thereof, will be transmitted, without charge, to the Commission in a mutually acceptable format, protocol, and transmission form.

- In the event Qwest does not provide CLEC and the Commission with a 14.3 monthly report by the last day of the month following the month for which performance results are being reported, Qwest will pay to the State a total of \$500 for each business day for which performance reports are 6 to 10 business days past the due date; \$1,000 for each business day for which performance reports are 11 to 15 business days past the due date; and \$2,000 for each business day for which performance results are more than 15 business days past the due date. If reports are on time but are missing performance results, Qwest will pay to the State a total of one-fifth of the late report amount for each missing performance measurement, subject to a cap of the full late report amount. These amounts represent the total payments for omitting performance measurements or missing any report deadlines. rather than a payment per report. Prior to the date of a payment for late reports, Qwest may file a request for a waiver of the payment, which states the reasons for the waiver. The Commission may grant the waiver, deny the waiver, or provide any other relief that may be appropriate.
- Tó the extent that Qwest recalculates payments made under this PAP, such recalculation shall be limited to the preceding three years (measured from the later of the provision of a monthly credit statement or payment due date). Qwest shall retain sufficient records to demonstrate fully the basis for its calculations for long enough to meet this potential recalculation obligation. CLEC verification or recalculation efforts should be made reasonably contemporaneously with Qwest measurements. In any event. Qwest shall maintain the records in a readily useable format for one year. For the remaining two years, the records may be retained in archived format. Any payment adjustments shall be subject to the interest rate provisions of section 11.1.

Integrated Audit Program/Investigations of Performance Results 15.0

Audits of the PAP shall be conducted under the auspices of the Commission in accordance with a detailed audit plan developed by an independent auditor and approved

by the Commission. The Commission shall select the independent auditor with input from Qwest and the CLECs. The Commission will determine, based upon requests and upon its own investigation, which results and/or measures should be audited. The Commission may, at its discretion, conduct audits through participation in a collaborative process with other states.

- 15.1.1 The initial audit plan shall be conducted over two years, with audit periods subsequent to the initial audit to be determined by the Commission. The Commission will determine the scope of and procedure for the audit plan, which, at a minimum, will identify the specific performance measurements to be audited, the specific tests to be conducted, and the entity to conduct them. The initial audit plan will give priority to auditing the higher risk areas identified in the Final OSS Report.
- 15.1.2 The Commission will attempt to coordinate its audit plan with other audit plans that may be conducted by other state commissions so as to avoid duplication. The audit shall be conducted so as not to impede Qwest's ability to comply with the other provisions of the PAP and should be of a nature and scope that it can be conducted in accordance with the reasonable course of Qwest's business operations.
- 15.1.3 Any dispute arising out of the audit plan, the conduct of the audit, or audit results shall be resolved by the Commission.
- 15.2 Qwest must report to the Commission monthly any changes it makes to the automated or manual processes used to produce performance results including data collection, generation, and reporting. The reports must include sufficient detail to enable the parties to understand the scope and nature of the changes.
- In the event of a disagreement between Qwest and CLEC as to any issue regarding the accuracy or integrity of data collected, generated, and reported pursuant to the PAP. Qwest and the CLEC shall first consult with one another and attempt in good faith. to resolve the issue. If an issue is not resolved within 45 days after a request for consultation, CLEC and Qwest may, upon a demonstration of good cause (e.g., evidence of material errors or discrepancies), request an independent audit to be conducted, at the initiating party's expense. The independent auditor will assess the need for an audit based upon whether there exists a material deficiency in the data or whether there exists an issue not otherwise addressed by the audit plan for the current cycle. The Commission will resolve any dispute by any party questioning the independent auditor's decision to conduct or not conduct a CLEC requested audit and the audit findings, should such an audit be conducted. Audit findings will include: (a) general applicability of findings and conclusions (i.e., relevance to CLECs or jurisdictions other than the ones causing test initiation), (b) magnitude of any payment adjustments required and, (c) whether cost responsibility should be shifted based upon the materiality and clarity of any Qwest nonconformance with measurement requirements (no pre-determined variance is appropriate. but should be based on the auditor's professional judgment). CLEC may not request an

- audit of data more than three years from the later of the provision of a monthly credit statement or payment due date.
- 15.4 Expenses for the audit of the PAP and any other related expenses incurred by the Commission, except that which may be assigned under section 15.3, shall be paid first from the Tier 2 funds in the Special Fund. If no Special Fund is in existence or Tier 2 funds are not otherwise sufficient to cover audit costs in whole or in part, the Commission will develop an additional funding method that will include contributions from CLECs' Tier 1 payments and from Qwest.
- 15.5 Any party may petition the Commission to request that Qwest investigate any consecutive Tier 1 miss or any second consecutive Tier 2 miss to determine the cause of the miss and to identify the action needed in order to meet the standard set forth in the performance measurements. Qwest will report the results of its investigation to the Commission, and to the extent an investigation determines that a CLEC was responsible in whole or in part for the Tier 2 misses, Qwest may petition the Commission to request that it receive credit against future Tier 2 payments in an amount equal to the Tier 2 payments that should not have been made. Qwest may also request that the relevant portion of subsequent Tier 2 payments will not be owed until any responsible CLEC problems are corrected. For the purposes of this sub-section, Tier 1 performance measurements that have not been designated as Tier 2 will be aggregated and the aggregate results will be investigated pursuant to the terms of this agreement.

16.0 Reviews

Every six (6) months beginning six months after the effective date of 271 approval by the FCC for the state of South Dakota, Qwest, CLECs, and the Commission shall participate in a review of the performance measurements to determine whether the measurements should be added, deleted, or modified; whether the applicable benchmark standards should be modified or replaced by standards; and whether to move a classification of a measurement to High, Medium, or Low or Tier 1 to Tier 2. Criteria for review of performance measurement, other than for possible reclassification, shall be whether there exists an omission or failure to capture intended performance, and whether there is duplication of another measurement. After the Commission considers changes proposed in the six month review process, it shall determine what, if any, changes shall be made by Qwest. The Commission retains its independent authority under state law to initiate a proceeding to review the PAP at any time and to order changes to any provisions of the PAP, after notice and hearing, and consistent with due process and other rights of all parties. No new performance measurements shall be added to the PAP that have not been subject to observation as a diagnostic measurement for a period of six (6) months, unless ordered otherwise by the Commission. Any changes made pursuant to this section shall apply to and modify this agreement.

- 16.1.1 Notwithstanding section 16.1, if any agreements on adding, modifying, deleting, performance measurements as permitted by section 16.1 are reached between Qwest and CLECs participating in an industry Regional Oversight Committee (ROC) PID administration forum, those agreements shall be incorporated into the QPAP and modify the agreement between CLEC and Qwest at any time those agreements are submitted to and approved by the Commission, whether before or after a six-month review.
- 16.1.2 Nothing in this PAP precludes the Commission from modifying the PAP based upon its independent state law authority, subject to judicial challenge. Nothing in this PAP constitutes a grant of authority by either party to this agreement nor does it constitute a waiver by either party to this agreement of any claim either party may have that the Commission lacks jurisdiction to make any modifications to this PAP, including any modifications resulting from the process described in Section 16.0.
- 16.2 Two years after the effective date of the first FCC 271 approval of the PAP, the Commission, by itself or in conjunction with other state commissions, may conduct a review by a independent third party to examine the continuing effectiveness of the PAP as a means of inducing compliant performance. Except for expenses which may be assigned under section 15.3, the expenses of any review by the state of South Dakota, or if the Commission participates in a multistate review, the expenses shall be paid first from the Tier 2 funds in the Special Fund. If no Special Fund is in existence or Tier 2 funds are not otherwise sufficient to cover audit costs in whole or in part, the Commission will develop an additional funding method that will include contribution from CLECs' Tier 1 payments and from Qwest.
- 16.3 Qwest will make the PAP available for CLEC interconnection agreements. Upon Qwest's elimination of its Section 272 affiliate or upon it exiting the interLATA market, Qwest may petition the Commission to phase out the PAP. At that time, a review of the PAP shall be conducted to determine whether a phase-out of the PAP is appropriate.

17.0 (Reserved for Future Use)

18.0 Dispute Resolution

Except as otherwise provided in the PAP, the Commission shall resolve any disputes.

Attachment 1: Tier 1 and Tier 2 Performance Measurements Subject to Per Occurrence Payment

Performance Measurement		Tier	1 Payn	nents	Tier	2 Payn	nents
		Low	Med	High	Low	Med	
GATEWAY							
Timely Outage Resolution	GA-7						Х
PRE-ORDER/ORDERS							
LSR Rejection Notice Interval	PO-3ª	X					
Firm Order Confirmations On Time	PO-5	X				Χ	
Work Completion Notification Timeliness	PO-6 ^b	X					
Billing Completion Notification Timeliness	PO-7 ^b	X					
Jeopardy Notice Interval	PO-8	X					
Timely Jeopardy Notices	PO-9	X					
Release Notifications	PO-16		. •				Х
ORDERING AND PROVISIONING						· · · · · ·	
Installation Commitments Met	OP-3°	1		Χ		X	
Installation Intervals	OP-4 ^d			X		X	
New Service Quality	OP-5a					i e	
	OP-5a OP-6 ^e			X		X	
Delayed Days Number Portability Timeliness	OP-8			X			
Coordinated Cuts On Time – Unbundled	OP-0	-		X		X	
Loops	OP-13a			^	-	Х	
LNP Disconnect Timeliness	OP-17			X		X	
					Ar Maria		
MAINTENANCE AND REPAIR							
Out of Service Cleared within 24 hours	MR-3			Χ			
All Troubles Cleared within 4 hours	MR-5			X			
Mean time to Restore	MR-			X			
	6a,b,c				,		
Repair Repeat Report Rate	MR-7			X		Χ	
Trouble Rate	MR-8			Χ		·Χ	
LNP Trouble Reports Cleared within 24	MR-11			X		Х	
Hours							
						-	
BILLING	'						
Time to Provide Recorded Usage Records	BI-1	X					X
Billing Accuracy-Adjustments for Errors	BI-3	X					
Billing Completeness	BI-4	X				Х	
NETWORK PERFORMANCE							
Trunk Blocking	NI-1			X			X
NXX Code Activation	NP-1			X			X

a. PO-3 is limited to PO-3a-1, PO-3b-1, and PO-3c.

- b. PO-6 is included with PO-7 as two "families:" PO-6a/PO-7a and PO-6b/PO-7b. Measurements within each family share a single payment opportunity with only the measurements with the highest payment being paid.
- c.. OP-4 is included with OP-6 as five "families:" OP-4a/OP-6-1, OP-4b/OP-6-2, OP-4c/OP-6-3, OP-4d/OP-6-4, and OP-4e/OP-6-5. Measurements within each family share a single payment opportunity with only the measurement with the highest payment being paid.
- d. For purposes of the PAP, OP-6a and OP-6b will be combined and treated as one. The combined OP-6 breaks down to OP-6-1 (within MSA), OP-6-2 (outside MSA), OP-6-3 (no dispatch), OP-6-4 (zone 1), and OP-6-5 (zone 2).

Attachment 2: Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Caps

Billing

Time to Provide Recorded Usage Records – BI-1 (Tier 1/Tier 2) Billing Accuracy – Adjustments for Errors – BI-3 (Tier 1) Billing Completeness – BI-4 (Tier 1/Tier 2)

PERFORMANCE ASSURANCE PLAN

PECEWE

NOV 0 3 2003

1.0 Introduction

SOUTH DAKOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

1.1 As set forth in this Agreement, Qwest and CLEC voluntarily agree to the terms of the following Performance Assurance Plan ("PAP"), prepared in conjunction with Qwest's application for approval under Section 271 of the Telecommunications Act of 1996 (the "Act") to offer in-region long distance service.

2.0 Plan Structure

- 2.1 The PAP is a two-tiered, self-executing remedy plan. CLEC shall be provided with Tier 1 payments if, as applicable, Qwest does not provide parity between the service it provides to CLEC and that which it provides to its own retail customers, or Qwest fails to meet applicable benchmarks.
- 2.1.1 As specified in section 7.0, if Qwest fails to meet parity and benchmark standards on an aggregate CLEC basis, Qwest shall make Tier 2 payments to a Fund administered by the state regulatory commission or, if required by existing law, to the state general fund.
- 2.2 As specified in sections 6.0 and 7.0 and Attachments 1 and 2, payment is generally on a per occurrence basis, (i.e., a set dollar payment times the number of non-conforming service events). For the performance measurements which do not lend themselves to per occurrence payment, payment is on a per measurement basis, (i.e., a set dollar payment). The level of payment also depends upon the number of consecutive months of non-conforming performance, (i.e., an escalating payment the longer the duration of non-conforming performance).
- 2.3 Qwest shall be in conformance with the parity standard when service Qwest provides to CLEC is equivalent to that which it provides meet the benchmark. Percentage benchmarks will be adjusted to round the allowable number of misses up or down to the closest integer, except when a benchmark standard and low CLEC volume are such that a 100% performance result would be required to meet the standard and has not been attained. In such a situation, the determination of whether Qwest meets or fails the benchmark standard will be made using performance results for the month in question, plus a sufficient number of consecutive months so that a 100% performance result would not be required to meet the standard. For purposes of section 6.2, a meet or fail determined by this procedure shall count as a single month to its retail customers. The PAP relies upon statistical scoring to determine whether any difference between CLEC and Qwest performance results is significant, that is, not attributable to simple random variation. Statistical parity shall exist when performance results for CLEC and for Qwest retail

Deleted: 1 ^{at}
 Deleted: March 3

analogue result in a z-value that is no greater than the critical z-values listed in the Critical Z-Statistical Table in section 5.0

2.4 For performance measurements that have no Qwest retail analogue, agreed upon benchmarks shall be used. Benchmarks shall be evaluated using a "stare and compare" method. For example, if the benchmark is for a particular performance measurement is 95% or better, Qwest performance results must be at least 95% to

3.0 Performance Measurements

3.1 The performance measurements included in the PAP are set forth in Attachment 1. Each performance measurement identified is defined in the Performance Indicator Definitions ("PIDs") developed in the ROC Operational Support System ("OSS") collaborative, and which are included in the SGAT at Exhibit B. The measurements have been designated as Tier 1, Tier 2, or both Tier 1 and Tier 2 and given a High, Medium, or Low designation.

4.0 Statistical Measurement

- 4.1 Qwest uses a statistical test, namely the modified "z-test," for evaluating the difference between two means (i.e., Qwest and CLEC service or repair intervals) or two percentages (e.g., Qwest and CLEC proportions), to determine whether a parity condition exists between the results for Qwest and the CLEC(s). The modified z-tests shall be applicable if the number of data points are greater than 30 for a given measurement. For testing measurements for which the number of data points are 30 or less, Qwest will use a permutation test to determine the statistical significance of the difference between Qwest and CLEC.
- 4.2 Qwest shall be in conformance when the monthly performance results for parity measurements (whether in the form of means, percents, or proportions and at the equivalent level of disaggregation) are such that the calculated z-test statistics are not greater than the critical z-values as listed in Table 1, section 5.0.
- 4.3 Qwest shall be in conformance with benchmark measurements when the monthly performance result equals or exceeds the benchmark, if a higher value means better performance, and when the monthly performance result equals or is less than the benchmark if a lower value means better performance.

The formula for determining parity using the modified z-test is:

 $z = DIFF / \sigma_{DIFF}$

Where:

 $DIFF = M_{Qwest} - M_{CLEC}$

Deleted: 1*1

Deleted: March 3

Mowest = Qwest average or proportion

 $M_{CLEC} = CLEC$ average or proportion

 $\sigma_{DIFF} = \text{square root } \Box \sigma^{\Box} Q \text{west } (1/n_{CLEC} + 1/n_{Qwest})]$

 σ^2_{Owest} = calculated variance for Qwest

 n_{Qwest} = number of observations or samples used in Qwest measurement

n_{CLEC} = number of observations or samples used in CLEC measurement

The modified z-tests will be applied to reported parity measurements that contain more than 30 data points.

In calculating the difference between Qwest and CLEC performance, the above formula applies when a larger Qwest value indicates a better level of performance. In cases where a smaller Qwest value indicates a higher level of performance, the order is reversed, i.e., Mourest, Mourest, and CLEC performance, the above formula applies when a larger Qwest value indicates a higher level of performance, the order is reversed, i.e., Mourest, and CLEC performance, the above formula applies when a larger Qwest value indicates a better level of performance, the above formula applies when a larger Qwest value indicates a better level of performance. In

4.3.1 For parity measurements where the number of data points is 30 or less, Qwest will apply a permutation test to test for statistical significance. Permutation analysis will be applied to calculate the z-statistic using the following logic:

Calculate the modified z-statistic for the actual arrangement of the data Pool and mix the CLEC and Qwest data sets Perform the following 1000 times:

Randomly subdivide the pooled data sets into two pools, one the same size as the original CLEC data set (n_{CLEC}) and one reflecting the remaining data points, and one reflecting the remaining data points, (which is equal to the size of the original Qwest data set or n_{QWEST}). Compute and store the modified z-test score (Z_S) for this sample.

Count the number of times the z-statistic for a permutation of the data is greater than the actual modified z- statistic

Compute the fraction of permutations for which the statistic for the rearranged data is greater than the statistic for the actual samples

If the fraction is greater than α , the significance level of the test, the hypothesis of no difference is not rejected, and the test is passed. The α shall be .05 when the critical z value is 1.645 and .15 when the critical z value is 1.04.

Deleted:	1 51	•
> uniterate uniterate uniterate properties un properties u		
Deleted:	March 3	

5.0 Critical Z-Value

5.1 The following table shall be used to determine the critical z-value that is referred to in section 6.0. It is based on the monthly business volume of the CLEC for the particular performance measurements for which statistic testing is being performed.

TABLE 1: CRITICAL Z-VALUE

CLEC	volume	LIS Trunks	, UDITs,	All Other
(Sample siz	e)	Resale, UBI	DS1 and	
		DS-3		
1-10		1.04*		1.645
11-150		1.645		1.645
151-300		2.0		2.0
301-600		2.7		2.7
601-3000		3.7		3.7
3001 and al	oove	4.3		4.3

* The 1.04 applies for individual month testing for performance measurements involving LIS trunks and DS-1 and DS-3 that are UDITs, Resale, or Unbundled Loops. The performance measurements are OP-3d/e, OP-4d/e, OP-5a, OP-6-4/5, MR-5a/b, MR-7d/e, and MR-8.

For purposes of determining consecutive month misses, 1.645 shall be used. Where performance measurements disaggregate to zone 1 and zone 2, the zones shall be combined for purposes of statistical testing.

6.0 Tier 1 Payments to CLEC

- 6.1 Tier 1 payments to CLEC shall be made solely for the performance measurements designated as Tier 1 on Attachment 1. The payment amount for non-conforming service varies depending upon the designation of performance measurements as High, Medium, and Low and the duration of the non-conforming service condition as described below. Non-conforming service is defined in section 4.0.
- 6.1.1 Determination of Non-Conforming Measurements: The number of performance measurements that are determined to be non-conforming and, therefore, eligible for Tier 1 payments, are limited according to the critical z-value shown in Table 1, section 5.0. The critical z-values are the statistical standard that determines for each CLEC performance measurement whether Qwest has met parity. The critical z-value is selected from Table 1 according to the monthly CLEC volume for the performance measurement. For instance, if the CLEC sample size for

Deleted: 1 st
Deleted: March 3

that month is 100, the critical z-value is 1.645 for the statistical testing of that parity performance measurement.

- 6.2 Determination of the Amount of Payment: Tier 1 payments to CLEC, except as provided for in sections 6.3 and 10.0, are calculated and paid monthly based on the number of performance measurements exceeding the critical z-value. Payments will be made on either a per occurrence or per measurement basis, depending upon the performance measurement, using the dollar amounts specified in Table 2 below. The dollar amounts vary depending upon whether the performance measurement is designated High, Medium, or Low and escalate depending upon the number of consecutive months for which Qwest has not met the standard for the particular measurement.
- 6.2.1 The escalation of payments for consecutive months of non-conforming service will be matched month for month with de-escalation of payments for every month of conforming service. For example, if Qwest has four consecutive monthly "misses" it will make payments that escalate from month 1 to month 4 as shown in Table 2. If, in the next month, service meets the standard, Qwest makes no payment. A payment "indicator" de-escalates down from month 4 to month 3. If Qwest misses the following month, it will make payment at the month 3 level of Table 2 because that is where the payment "indicator" presently sits. If Qwest misses again the following month, it will make payments that escalate back to the month 4 level. The payment level will de-escalate back to the original month 1 level only upon conforming service sufficient to move the payment "indicator" back to the month 1 level.
- 6.2.2 For those performance measurements listed on Attachment 2 as "Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Caps," payment to a CLEC in a single month shall not exceed the amount listed in Table 2 below for the "Per Measurement" category. For those performance measurements listed on Attachment 2 as "Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Payments," payment to a CLEC will be the amount set forth in Table 2 below under the section labeled "per measurement."

TABLE 2: TIER-1 PAYMENTS TO CLEC

Per Occurrence							
Measurement Group	Month 1	Month 2	Month 3	Month 4	Month 5	Month 6	Each following month after Month 6 add
High	\$150	\$250	\$500	\$600	\$700	\$800	\$100
Medium	\$ 75	\$150	\$300	\$400	\$500	\$600	\$100
Low	\$ 25	\$ 50	\$100	\$200	\$300	\$400	\$100

Deleted: 1st
Deleted: March 3

Qwest South Dakota SGAT 4th Revision, 2nd Revised, Page 5

Exhibit K

October 31, 2003

Per Measurement Cap							
Measurement Group	Month 1	Month 2	Month 3	Month 4	Month 5	Month 6	Each following month after Month 6 add
High	\$25,000	\$50,00 0	\$75,00 0	\$100,00 0	\$125,00 0	\$150,000	\$25,000
Medium	\$10,000	\$20,00 0	\$30,00 0	\$ 40,000	\$ 50,000	\$ 60,000	\$ 10,000
Low	\$ 5,000	\$10,00 0	\$15,00 0	\$ 20,000	\$ 25,000	\$ 30,000	\$ 5,000

6.3 For collocation, CP-2 and CP-4 performance measurements shall be relied upon for delineation of collocation business rules. For purposes of calculating Tier 1 payments, collocation jobs and collocation feasibility studies that are later than the due date will have a per day payment applied according to Table 3. The per day payment will be applied to any collocation job in which the feasibility study is provided or the collocation installation is completed later than the scheduled date. The calculation of the payment amount will be performed by applying the per day payment amounts as specified in Table 3. Thus, for days 1 through 10, the payment is \$150 per day. For days 11 through 20, the payment is \$300 per day and so on.

TABLE 3: TIER-1 COLLOCATION PAYMENTS TO CLECS

	• • • · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
Days Late	Completion Date	Feasibility Study
1 to 10 days	\$150/day	\$45/day
11 to 20 days	\$300/day	\$90/day
21 to 30 days	\$450/day	\$135/day
31 to 40 days	\$600/day	\$180/day
More than 40 days	\$1,000/day	\$300/day

6.4 A minimum payment calculation shall be performed at the end of each year for each CLEC with annual order volumes of no more than 1,200. The payment shall be calculated by multiplying \$2,000 by the number of months in which at least one payment was made to the CLEC. To the extent that the actual CLEC payment for the year is less than the product of the preceding calculation, Qwest shall make an additional payment equal to the difference.

7.0 Tier 2 Payments to the State

7.1 Payments to the State shall be limited to the performance measurements designated in section 7.4 for Tier 2 per measurement payments and in Attachment 1 for per occurrence payments and which have at least 10 data points each month for

_		
[eleted: 1st	
Ψ		1171
1	eleted: March 3	

the period payments are being calculated. Similar to the Tier 1 structure, Tier 2 measurements are categorized as High, Medium, and Low and the amount of payments for non-conformance varies according to this categorization.

- 7.2 Determination of Non-Conforming Measurements: The determination of non-conformance will be based upon the aggregate of all CLEC data for each Tier 2 performance measurement. Non-conforming service is defined in section 4.2 (for parity measurements) and 4.3 (for benchmark measurements), except that a 1.645 critical z-value shall be used for all parity measurements but MR-2 and OP-2. The critical z-value is the statistical standard that determines for each performance measurement whether Qwest has met parity.
- 7.3 Determination of the Amount of Payment: Except as provided in section 7.4, Tier 2 payments are calculated and paid monthly based on the number of performance measurements exceeding the critical z-value, identified in section 7.2, in a single month. Payment will be made on either a per occurrence or per measurement basis, whichever is applicable to the performance measurement, using the dollar amounts specified in Table 4 or Table 5 below. Except as provided in section 7.4, the dollar amounts vary depending upon whether the performance measurement is designated High, Medium, or Low.
- 7.3.1 For those Tier 2 measurements listed on Attachment 2 as "Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Caps," payment to the State in a single month shall not exceed the amount listed in Table 4 for the "Per Measurement" category.

TABLE 4: TIER-2 PAYMENTS TO STATE FUNDS

Per Occurrence

currence	
Measurement Group	
High	
	\$500
Medium	
	\$300
Low	
	\$200

Per Measurement/Cap

Measurement Group	
High	\$75,000
Medium	\$30,000
Low	\$20,000

7.4 <u>Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Payment</u>: The following Tier 2 performance measurements shall have their performance results measured on a region-wide (14 state) basis. Failure to meet the performance standard, therefore, will result in a per measurement payment in each of the Qwest in-region 14 states adopting this PAP. The performance measurements are:

		-1
1	Deleted:	1"
ĺ	<u></u>	
	Deleted:	March 3

GA-1: Gateway Availability - IMA-GUI GA-2: Gateway Availability - IMA-EDI GA-3: Gateway Availability - EB-TA GA-4: System Availability - EXACT GA-6: Gateway Availability - GUI-Repair

PO-1: Pre-Order/Order Response Times

OP-2: Call Answered within Twenty Seconds - Interconnect Provisioning

Center

MR-2: Calls Answered within Twenty Seconds – Interconnect Repair Center PO-20: Manual Service Order Accuracy

GA-1 has three sub-measurements: GA-1A, GA-1B, and GA-1C. PO-1 shall have two sub-measurements: PO-1A and PO-1B. PO-1A and PO-1B shall have their transaction types aggregated together. PO-20 shall have two product disaggregations – Resale POTS / UNE-P (POTS) and Unbundled Loops (Analog and Non-Loaded 2-Wire).

For these measurements, Qwest will make a Tier 2 payment based upon monthly performance results according to Table 5: Tier 2 Per Measurement Payments to State Funds.

TABLE 5: TIER-2 PER MEASUREMENT PAYMENTS TO STATE FUNDS

Measurement Performance		State	14 State
		Payment	Payment
GA-1,2,3,4,6	1% or lower	\$1,000	\$14,000
	>1% to 3%	\$10,000	\$140,000
	>3% to 5%	\$20,000	\$280,000
	>5%	\$30,000	\$420,000
PO-1	2 sec. Or less	\$1,000	\$14,000
	>2 sec. to 5	\$5,000	\$70,000
	sec.		
	>5 sec. to 10	\$10,000	\$140,000
	sec.		
	>10 sec.	\$15,000	\$210,000
OP-2/MR-2	1% or lower	\$1,000	\$14,000
	>1% to 3%	\$5,000	\$70,000
	>3% to 5%	\$10,000	\$140,000
	>5%	\$15,000	\$210,000
PO-20			
- Resale POTS /	1% or lower	\$500	\$7,000
UNE-P (POTS)	>1% to 3%	\$2,500	\$35,000

Deleted: 1st

Deleted: March 3

Qwest South Dakota SGAT 4th Revision, 2nd Revised, Page 8

Exhibit K

October 31, 2003

	>3% to 5%	\$5,000	\$70,000
	>5%	\$7,500	\$105,000
		-	
- Unbundled Loops	1% or lower	\$500	\$7,000
(Analog and 2-	>1% to 3%	\$2,500	\$35,000
Wire			
Non-Loaded)	>3% to 5%	\$5,000	\$70,000
	>5%	\$7,500	\$105,000

7.5 Payment of Tier 2 Funds: Payments to a state fund shall be used for any purpose determined by the Commission that is allowed to it by state law. If the Commission is not permitted by state law to receive or administer Tier 2 payments, payments shall be made to the state general fund or to such other source as may be provided for under state law.

8.0 Step by Step Calculation of Monthly Tier 1 Payments to CLEC

- 8.1 Application of the Critical Z-Values: Qwest shall identify the Tier 1 parity performance measurements that measure the service provided to CLEC by Qwest for the month in question and the critical z-value from Table 1 in section 5.0 that shall be used for purposes of statistical testing for each particular performance measurement. The statistical testing procedures described in section 4.0 shall be applied. For the purpose of determining the critical z-values, each disaggregated category of a performance measurement is treated as a separate sub-measurement. The critical z-value to be applied is determined by the CLEC volume at each level of disaggregation or sub-measurement.
- 8.2 Performance Measurements for which Tier 1 Payment is Per Occurrence:
- 8.2.1 Performance Measurements that are Averages or Means:
- 8.2.1.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the average or the mean that would yield the critical z-value shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 8.2.1.2 Step 2: The percentage differences between the actual averages and the calculated averages shall be calculated. The calculation is % diff = (CLEC result Calculated Value)/Calculated Value.
- 8.2.1.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the percentage calculated in the previous step and the per occurrence dollar amounts from the Tier 1 Payment Table shall determine the payment to the CLEC for each non-conforming performance measurement.

Deleted:	1 ⁵¹
Deleted	Manak O

- 8.2.2 Performance Measurements that are Percentages:
- 8.2.2.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the percentage that would yield the critical z-value shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z- statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 8.2.2.2 Step 2: The difference between the actual percentages for the CLEC and the calculated percentages shall be determined.
- 8.2.2.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the difference in percentage calculated in the previous step, and the per occurrence dollar amount taken from the Tier 1 Payment Table, to determine the payment to the CLEC for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- 8.2.3 Performance Measurements that are Ratios or Proportions:
- 8.2.3.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement the ratio that would yield the critical z-value shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 8.2.3.2 Step 2: The absolute difference between the actual rate for the CLEC and the calculated rate shall be determined.
- 8.2.3.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the difference calculated in the previous step, and the per occurrence dollar amount taken from the Tier 1 Payment Table, to determine the payment to the CLEC for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- 8.3 Performance Measurements for which Tier 1 Payment is Per Measure:
- 8.3.1 For each performance measurement where Qwest fails to meet the standard, the payment to the CLEC shall be the dollar amount shown on the "per measure" portion of Table 2: Tier 1 Payments to CLEC.
- 9.0 Step by Step Calculation of Monthly Tier 2 Payments to State Funds
- 9.1 Application of the Critical Z-Values: Qwest shall identify the Tier 2 parity performance measurements that measure the service provided to all CLECs by Qwest for the month in question. The statistical testing procedures described in section 4.0 shall be applied, except that a 1.645 critical z-value shall be used for all parity measurements except MR-2 and OP-2. If Qwest misses a performance

-	Deleted: 1 ⁵¹	
-	Deleted: March 3	

standard and there are at least 10 data points for the performance measurement, a Tier 2 payment will be calculated and paid as described below and will continue in each succeeding month until Qwest's performance meets the applicable standard.

- 9.2 Performance Measurements for which Tier 2 Payment is Per Occurrence:
- 9.2.1 Performance Measurements that are Averages or Means:
- 9.2.1.1 Step 1: The monthly average or the mean for each performance measurement that would yield the critical z-value for each month shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 9.2.1.2 Step 2: The percentage difference between the actual averages and the calculated averages for each month shall be calculated. The calculation for parity measurements is % diff = (actual average calculated average)/calculated average.
- 9.2.1.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points for the non-conforming month shall be multiplied by the percentage calculated in the previous step and multiplied by the result of the per occurrence dollar amount taken from the Tier 2 Payment Table to determine the payment to the State for each non-conforming performance measurement.
- 9.3 Performance Measurements that are Percentages:
- 9.3.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the monthly percentage that would yield the critical z-value for each month shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 9.3.1.2 Step 2: The difference between the actual percentages and the calculated percentages for the non-conforming month shall be calculated. The calculation for parity measurement is diff = (CLEC result calculated percentage). This formula shall be applicable where a high value is indicative of poor performance. The formula shall be reversed where high performance is indicative of good performance.
- 9.3.1.3 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points for the non-conforming month shall be multiplied by the difference in percentage calculated in the previous step and multiplied by the result of the per occurrence dollar amounts taken from the Tier 2 Payment Table to determine the payment to the State.

Deleted: 1 st
Deleted: March 3

- 9.4 Performance Measurements that are Ratios or Proportions:
- 9.4.1 Step 1: For each performance measurement, the ratio that would yield the critical z-value for each month shall be calculated. The same denominator as the one used in calculating the z-statistic for the measurement shall be used. (For benchmark measurements, the benchmark value shall be used.)
- 9.4.1.1 Step 2: The difference between the actual rate for the CLEC and the calculated rate for the non-conforming month shall be calculated. The calculation is: diff = (CLEC rate calculated rate). This formula shall apply where a high value is indicative of poor performance. The formula shall be reversed where high performance is indicative of good performance.
- 9.4.1.2 Step 3: For each performance measurement, the total number of data points shall be multiplied by the difference calculated in the previous step for the non-conforming month and multiplied by the result of the per occurrence dollar amounts taken from the Tier 2 Payment Table to determine the payment to the State.
- 9.5 Performance Measurements for which Tier 2 Payment is Per Measure:
- 9.5.1 For each performance measurement where Qwest fails to meet the standard, the payment to the State Fund shall be the dollar amount shown on the "per measure" portion of the Tier 2 Payment Table.

10.0 Low Volume, Developing Markets

- 10.1 For certain qualifying performance standards, if the aggregate monthly volumes of CLECs participating in the PAP are more than 10, but less than 100, Qwest will make Tier 1 payments to CLECs for failure to meet the parity or benchmark standard for the qualifying performance sub-measurements. The qualifying sub-measurements are the UNE-P (POTS), megabit resale, and ADSL qualified loop product disaggregation of OP-3, OP-4, OP-5a, MR-3, MR-5, MR-7, and MR-8. If the aggregate monthly CLEC volume is greater than 100, the provisions of this section shall not apply to the qualifying performance sub-measurement.
- 10.2 The determination of whether Qwest has met the parity or benchmark standards will be made using aggregate volumes of CLECs participating in the PAP. In the event Qwest does not meet the applicable performance standards, a total payment to affected CLECs will be determined in accordance with the high, medium, low designation for each performance measurement (see Attachment 1) and as described in section 8.0, except that CLEC aggregate volumes will be used. In the event the calculated total payment amount to CLECs is less than \$5,000, a minimum payment of \$5,000 shall be made. The resulting total payment amount to CLECs will

.	Deleted:	1 st
	Deleted:	March 3

be apportioned to the affected CLECs based upon each CLEC's relative share of the number of total service misses.

10.3 At the six (6)-month reviews, Qwest will consider adding to the above list of qualifying performance sub-measurements, new products disaggregation representing new modes of CLEC entry into developing markets.

11.0 Payment

- 11.1 Payments to CLEC, the State, or the Special Fund shall be made one month following the due date of the performance measurement report for the month for which payment is being made. Qwest will pay interest on any late payment and underpayment at the prime rate as reported in the Wall Street Journal. On any overpayment, Qwest is allowed to offset future payments by the amount of the overpayment plus interest at the prime rate.
- 11.2 Payment to CLEC shall be made via bill credits. Bill credits shall be identified on a summary format substantially similar to that distributed as a prototype to the CLECs and the Commissions. To the extent that a monthly payment owed to CLEC under this PAP exceeds the amount owed to Qwest by CLEC on a monthly bill, Qwest will issue a check or wire transfer to CLEC in the amount of the overage. Payment to the State shall be made via check or wire transfer.
- 11.3 Upon the execution of a memorandum of understanding with the South Dakota Commission, a South Dakota Special Fund and a South Dakota Discretionary Fund shall be created for the purposes and in accordance with section 11.0. The South Dakota Commission shall authorize disbursement of funds. All claims against the funds shall be presented to the Commission and shall be the responsibility of the South Dakota Commission.
- 11.3.1 Qwest shall establish the South Dakota Special Fund and the South Dakota Discretionary Fund as separate interest bearing escrow accounts. Upon Qwest receiving effective section 271 authority from the FCC for the state of South Dakota, the Commission shall determine and direct Qwest to deposit into the South Dakota Special Fund either 1) one-fifth of all Tier 1 payments that exceed the month 1 payment amounts in Table 2 and one-third of all Tier 2 payments or 2) 50% of all Tier 2 payments. Qwest shall deposit any other Tier 2 payments into the South Dakota Discretionary Fund. The costs of the escrow accounts will be paid for from the accounts' funds.
- 11.3.2 The South Dakota Special Fund shall be created to pay the independent auditor and audit costs for the purpose of regional or state audits as specified in section 15.1 or, and to pay expenses incurred by the Commission in participating in any regional review of the PIDs. Disbursements from the South Dakota Special Fund

Deleted:	191
Deleted:	March 3

shall first be from Tier 2 funds and second from Tier 1 funds. Not less than every two years, Tier 1 funds that are not needed to meet the continuing obligations of the Special Fund shall be returned on a pro-rata basis to CLECs, including any interest not used for fund administration. Other than the transfer of funds allowed in section 11.3.2.1, disbursements from the South Dakota Discretionary Fund shall be for, but not limited to, South Dakota telecommunications initiatives. Any excess funds in the South Dakota Special Fund may be transferred to the South Dakota Discretionary Fund at the Commission's discretion.

- 11.3.2.1 If the South Dakota Commission chooses not to participate in the regional audit pursuant to section 15.1 and the account balance of the South Dakota Special Fund escrow account is less than \$50,000 at the time of any state audit described in section 15.1, a transfer of funds from the South Dakota Discretionary Fund to the South Dakota Special Fund shall be allowed in the amount necessary to bring the South Dakota Special Fund balance to \$50,000.
- 11.3.3 Notwithstanding the provisions herein, Qwest shall advance sufficient funds to any consolidated Special Fund established by participating states, set up for the purpose of a regional audit as specified in sections 15.1, not to exceed \$200,000 (or \$500,000 in the event 6 or more states participate in the regional audit) in order to meet initial claims against that Fund to the extent that contributions from Tier 1 and/or Tier 2 payments are insufficient. Qwest shall be allowed to recover any such advances plus interest at the rate that such an escrow account would have earned from future Tier 2 payments.

12.0 Cap on Tier 1 and Tier 2 Payments

- 12.1 There shall be a cap on the total payments made by Qwest for a 12-month period beginning with the effective date of the PAP for the State of South Dakota. The annual cap for the State of South Dakota shall be 36% of the prior year's ARMIS Net Return, or \$15,000,000, whichever is greater, subject to any applicable adjustments permitted pursuant to section 12.2. Qwest shall submit to the Commission the calculation of each year's cap no later than 30 days after submission of ARMIS results to the FCC. CLEC agrees that this amount constitutes a maximum annual cap that shall apply to the aggregate total of Tier 1 liquidated damages, including any such damages paid pursuant to this Agreement, any other interconnection agreement, or any other payments made for the same underlying activity or omission under any other contract, order or rule and Tier 2 assessments or payments made by Qwest for the same underlying activity or omission under any other contract, order or rule.
- 12.2 If Qwest payments equal or exceed the annual cap for two years in a row or equal or exceed 1/3rd of the annual cap in a combination of two consecutive months, the Commission shall have the authority to open a proceeding to request Qwest to explain the non-conforming performance and show that it did not result from Qwest's failure to act in a prudent manner to avoid reasonably foreseeable consequences.

De	let	ed	:	1"	
·					

Deleted: March 3

The Commission may raise the cap to the amount which Qwest would have paid in the higher of the prior two years, may ask the Federal Communication Commission ("FCC") to halt Qwest's in-region interLATA long distance marketing authority for a particular interval, or may take other appropriate action.

- 12.3 If the annual cap is reached, each CLEC shall, as of the end of the plan year, be entitled to receive the same percentage of its total calculated Tier 1 payments. In order to preserve the operation of the annual cap, the percentage of equalization shall take place as follows:
- 12.3.1 The amount by which any month's total year-to-date Tier 1 and Tier 2 payments exceeds the cumulative monthly cap (defined as 1/12th of the annual cap times the cumulative number of months to date) shall be calculated and apportioned between Tier 1 and Tier 2 according to the percentage that each bore of total payments for the year-to-date. The Tier 1 apportionment resulting of this calculation shall be known as the "Tracking Account."
- 12.3.2 The Tier 1 apportionment shall be debited against the monthly payment due to each CLEC, by applying to the year-to-date payments received by each the percentage necessary to generate the required total Tier 1 amount.
- 12.3.3 The Tracking Amount shall be apportioned among all CLECs so as to provide each with payments equal in percentage of its total year to date Tier 1 payment calculations.
- 12.3.4 This calculation shall take place in the first month that the year-to-date total Tier 1 and Tier 2 payments are expected to exceed the cumulative monthly cap and for each month of that year thereafter. Qwest shall recover any debited amounts by reducing payments due to any CLEC for that month and any succeeding months, as necessary.

13.0 Limitations

- 13.1 The PAP shall not become available in the State unless and until Qwest receives effective section 271 authority from the FCC for that State.
- 13.2 Qwest will not be liable for Tier 1 payments to CLEC in an FCC approved state until the Commission has approved an interconnection agreement between CLEC and Qwest which adopts the provisions of this PAP.
- 13.3 Qwest shall not be obligated to make Tier 1 or Tier 2 payments for any measurement if and to the extent that non-conformance for that measurement was the result of any of the following: 1) with respect to performance measurements with a benchmark standard, a Force Majeure event as defined in section 5.7 of the SGAT. Qwest will provide notice of the occurrence of a Force Majeure event within 72 hours

Deleted:	1#1
Deleted:	March 3

of the time Qwest learns of the event or within a reasonable time frame that Qwest should have learned of it; 2) an act or omission by a CLEC that is contrary to any of its obligations under its interconnection agreement with Qwest or under federal or state law; an act or omission by CLEC that is in bad faith. Examples of bad faith conduct include, but are not limited to: unreasonably holding service orders and/or applications, "dumping" orders or applications in unreasonably large batches, "dumping" orders or applications at or near the close of a business day, on a Friday evening or prior to a holiday, and failing to provide timely forecasts to Qwest for services or facilities when such forecasts are explicitly required by the SGAT: 3) problems associated with third-party systems or equipment, which could not have been avoided by Qwest in the exercise of reasonable diligence, provided, however, that this third party exclusion will not be raised in the State more than three times within a calendar year. If a Force Majeure event or other excusing event recognized in this section merely suspends Qwest's ability to timely perform an activity subject to a performance measurement that is an interval measure, the applicable time frame in which Qwest's compliance with the parity or benchmark criterion is measured will be extended on an hour-for-hour or day-for-day basis, as applicable, equal to the duration of the excusing event.

- 13.3.1 Qwest will not be excused from Tier 1 or Tier 2 payments for any reason except as described in Section 13.0. Qwest will have the burden of demonstrating that its non-conformance with the performance measurement was excused on one of the grounds described in this PAP. A party may petition the Commission to require Qwest to deposit disputed payments into an escrow account when the requesting party can show cause, such as grounds provided in the Uniform Commercial Code for cases of commercial uncertainty.
- 13.3.2 Notwithstanding any other provision of this PAP, it shall not excuse performance that Qwest could reasonably have been expected to deliver assuming that it had designed, implemented, staffed, provisioned, and otherwise provided for resources reasonably required to meet foreseeable volumes and patterns of demands upon its resources by CLECs.
- 13.4 Qwest's agreement to implement these enforcement terms, and specifically its agreement to pay any "liquidated damages" or "assessments" hereunder, will not be considered as an admission against interest or an admission of liability in any legal, regulatory, or other proceeding relating in whole or in part to the same performance.
- 13.4.1 CLEC may not use: 1) the existence of this enforcement plan; or 2) Qwest's payment of Tier -1 "liquidated damages" or Tier 2 "assessments" as evidence that Qwest has discriminated in the provision of any facilities or services under Sections 251 or 252, or has violated any state or federal law or regulation. Qwest's conduct underlying its performance measures, however are not made inadmissible by its terms.

	and the second and						
.	Deleted:	1 st					
	Deleted:	Mar	ch :	3	munocom	 	turii.

- 13.4.2 By accepting this performance remedy plan, CLEC agrees that Qwest's performance with respect to this remedy plan may not be used as an admission of liability or culpability for a violation of any state or federal law or regulation. (Nothing herein is intended to preclude Qwest from introducing evidence of any Tier 1 "liquidated damages" under these provisions for the purpose of offsetting the payment against any other damages or payments a CLEC might recover.) The terms of this paragraph do not apply to any proceeding before the Commission or the FCC to determine whether Qwest has met or continues to meet the requirements of section 271 of the Act.
- 13.5 By incorporating these liquidated damages terms into the PAP, Qwest and CLEC accepting this PAP agree that proof of damages from any non-conforming performance measurement would be difficult to ascertain and, therefore, liquidated damages are a reasonable approximation of any contractual damages that may result from a non-conforming performance measurement. Qwest and CLEC further agree that Tier 1 payments made pursuant to this PAP are not intended to be a penalty. The application of the assessments and damages provided for herein is not intended to foreclose other non-contractual legal and non-contractual regulatory claims and remedies that may be available to a CLEC.
- 13.6 This PAP contains a comprehensive set of performance measurements, statistical methodologies, and payment mechanisms that are designed to function together, and only together, as an integrated whole. To elect the PAP, CLEC must adopt the PAP in its entirety in its interconnection agreement with Qwest in lieu of other alternative standards or relief. Where alternative standards or remedies for Qwest's wholesale performance are available under rules, orders, or contracts, including interconnection agreements, CLEC will be limited to either PAP standards and remedies or the standards and remedies available under rules, orders or contracts and CLECs choice of remedies shall be specified in its interconnection agreement.
- 13.7 Any liquidated damages payment by Qwest under these provisions is not hereby made inadmissible in any proceeding related to the same conduct where Qwest seeks to offset the payments against any other damages a CLEC may recover; whether or not the nature of the damages sought by the CLEC is such that an offset is appropriate will be determined in the relevant proceeding.
- 13.8 To the extent Qwest believes that some Tier 2 payments required to be made under this PAP would duplicate payments that have been assessed by or on behalf of the Commission pursuant to any service quality rules or Commission orders, Qwest may make such Tier 2 payments to a special interest bearing escrow account and then dispute the payments before the South Dakota Commission. If Qwest can show that the payments relate to the same underlying activity or omission, it may retain the Tier 2 payments and any interest accrued on such payments.

	Deleted: 1 st
٠.	Deleted: March 3

- 13.9 Whenever a Qwest Tier 1 payment to an individual CLEC exceeds \$3 million in a month, Qwest may commence a proceeding to demonstrate why it should not be required to pay any amount in excess of the \$3 million. Upon timely commencement of the proceeding, Qwest must pay the balance of payments owed in excess of \$3 million into escrow, to be held by a third-party pending the outcome of the proceeding. To invoke these escrow provisions, Qwest must file, not later than the due date of the Tier 1 payments, its application. Qwest will have the burden of proof to demonstrate why, under the circumstances, it would be unjust to require it to make the payments in excess of \$3 million. If Qwest reports non-conforming performance to CLEC for three consecutive months on 20% or more of the measurements reported to CLEC and has incurred no more than \$1 million in liability to CLEC, then CLEC may commence a similar proceeding. In any such proceeding CLEC will have the burden of proof to demonstrate why, under the circumstances, justice requires Qwest to make payments in excess of the amount calculated pursuant to the terms of the PAP. The disputes identified in this section shall be resolved in a manner specified in the Dispute Resolution section of the SGAT with the CLEC.
- 13.10 Any payments made by Qwest as a result of the PAP should not: 1) be included as expenses in any Qwest revenue requirement, or 2) be reflected in increased rates to CLECs for services and facilities provided pursuant to Section 251(c) of the Telecommunication Act of 1996 and priced pursuant to Section 252(d) of the Telecommunications Act of 1996.
- 13.11 This Exhibit K may be assigned as a part of any agreement to which SGAT Section 5.12.1 is applicable.

14.0 Reporting

- 14.1 Upon receiving effective section 271 authority from the FCC for a state, Qwest will provide CLEC that has an approved interconnection agreement with Qwest, a monthly report of Qwest's performance for the measurements identified in the PAP by the last day of the month following the month for which performance results are being reported. However, Qwest shall have a grace period of five business days, so that Qwest shall not be deemed out of compliance with its reporting obligations before the expiration of the five business day grace period. Qwest will collect, analyze, and report performance data for the measurements listed on Attachment 1 in accordance with the most recent version of the PIDs. Upon CLEC's request, data files of the CLEC's raw data, or any subset thereof, will be transmitted, without charge, to CLEC in a mutually acceptable format, protocol, and transmission medium.
- 14.2 Qwest will also provide the Commission a monthly report of aggregate CLEC performance results pursuant to the PAP by the last day of the month following the month for which performance results are being reported. However, Qwest shall have a grace period of five business days, so that Qwest shall not be deemed out of

Deleted:	151
 Deleted:	March 3

compliance with its reporting obligations before the expiration of the five business day grace period. Individual CLEC reports of participating CLECs will also be available to the Commission upon request. By accepting this PAP, CLEC consents to Qwest providing CLEC's report and raw data to the State Commission. Pursuant to the terms of an order of the Commission, Qwest may provide CLEC-specific data that relates to the PAP, provided that Qwest shall first initiate any procedures necessary to protect the confidentiality and to prevent the public release of the information pending any applicable Commission procedures and further provided that Qwest provides such notice as the Commission directs to the CLEC involved, in order to allow it to prosecute such procedures to their completion. Data files of participating CLEC raw data, or any subset thereof, will be transmitted, without charge, to the Commission in a mutually acceptable format, protocol, and transmission form.

- 14.3 In the event Qwest does not provide CLEC and the Commission with a monthly report by the last day of the month following the month for which performance results are being reported, Qwest will pay to the State a total of \$500 for each business day for which performance reports are 6 to 10 business days past the due date; \$1,000 for each business day for which performance reports are 11 to 15 business days past the due date; and \$2,000 for each business day for which performance results are more than 15 business days past the due date. If reports are on time but are missing performance results, Qwest will pay to the State a total of one-fifth of the late report amount for each missing performance measurement, subject to a cap of the full late report amount. These amounts represent the total payments for omitting performance measurements or missing any report deadlines, rather than a payment per report. Prior to the date of a payment for late reports, Qwest may file a request for a waiver of the payment, which states the reasons for the waiver. The Commission may grant the waiver, deny the waiver, or provide any other relief that may be appropriate.
- 14.4 To the extent that Qwest recalculates payments made under this PAP, such recalculation shall be limited to the preceding three years (measured from the later of the provision of a monthly credit statement or payment due date). Qwest shall retain sufficient records to demonstrate fully the basis for its calculations for long enough to meet this potential recalculation obligation. CLEC verification or recalculation efforts should be made reasonably contemporaneously with Qwest measurements. In any event, Qwest shall maintain the records in a readily useable format for one year. For the remaining two years, the records may be retained in archived format. Any payment adjustments shall be subject to the interest rate provisions of section 11.1.

15.0 Integrated Audit Program/Investigations of Performance Results

15.1 Audits of the PAP shall be conducted under the auspices of the Commission in accordance with a detailed audit plan developed by an independent auditor and approved

Deleted: 1 ^{s1}	
Deleted: March	3

Qwest South Dakota SGAT 4th Revision, <u>2nd Revised</u>, Page 19

Exhibit K

October 31, 2003

by the Commission. The Commission shall select the independent auditor with input from Qwest and the CLECs. The Commission will determine, based upon requests and upon its own investigation, which results and/or measures should be audited. The Commission may, at its discretion, conduct audits through participation in a collaborative process with other states.

- 15.1.1 The initial audit plan shall be conducted over two years, with audit periods subsequent to the initial audit to be determined by the Commission. The Commission will determine the scope of and procedure for the audit plan, which, at a minimum, will identify the specific performance measurements to be audited, the specific tests to be conducted, and the entity to conduct them. The initial audit plan will give priority to auditing the higher risk areas identified in the Final OSS Report.
- 15.1.2 The Commission will attempt to coordinate its audit plan with other audit plans that may be conducted by other state commissions so as to avoid duplication. The audit shall be conducted so as not to impede Qwest's ability to comply with the other provisions of the PAP and should be of a nature and scope that it can be conducted in accordance with the reasonable course of Qwest's business operations.
- 15.1.3 Any dispute arising out of the audit plan, the conduct of the audit, or audit results shall be resolved by the Commission.
- 15.2 Qwest must report to the Commission monthly any changes it makes to the automated or manual processes used to produce performance results including data collection, generation, and reporting. The reports must include sufficient detail to enable the parties to understand the scope and nature of the changes.
- In the event of a disagreement between Qwest and CLEC as to any issue regarding the accuracy or integrity of data collected, generated, and reported pursuant to the PAP, Qwest and the CLEC shall first consult with one another and attempt in good faith to resolve the issue. If an issue is not resolved within 45 days after a request for consultation, CLEC and Qwest may, upon a demonstration of good cause (e.g., evidence of material errors or discrepancies), request an independent audit to be conducted, at the initiating party's expense. The independent auditor will assess the need for an audit based upon whether there exists a material deficiency in the data or whether there exists an issue not otherwise addressed by the audit plan for the current cycle. The Commission will resolve any dispute by any party questioning the independent auditor's decision to conduct or not conduct a CLEC requested audit and the audit findings, should such an audit be conducted. Audit findings will include: (a) general applicability of findings and conclusions (i.e., relevance to CLECs or jurisdictions other than the ones causing test initiation), (b) magnitude of any payment adjustments required and, (c) whether cost responsibility should be shifted based upon the materiality and clarity of any Qwest nonconformance with measurement requirements (no pre-determined variance is appropriate. but should be based on the auditor's professional judgment). CLEC may not request an

,	Deleted: 1 ^{s1}
	Deleted: March 3

audit of data more than three years from the later of the provision of a monthly credit statement or payment due date.

- Expenses for the audit of the PAP and any other related expenses incurred by the Commission, except that which may be assigned under section 15.3, shall be paid first from the Tier 2 funds in the Special Fund. If no Special Fund is in existence or Tier 2 funds are not otherwise sufficient to cover audit costs in whole or in part, the Commission will develop an additional funding method that will include contributions from CLECs' Tier 1 payments and from Qwest.
- 15.5 Any party may petition the Commission to request that Qwest investigate any consecutive Tier 1 miss or any second consecutive Tier 2 miss to determine the cause of the miss and to identify the action needed in order to meet the standard set forth in the performance measurements. Qwest will report the results of its investigation to the Commission, and to the extent an investigation determines that a CLEC was responsible in whole or in part for the Tier 2 misses, Qwest may petition the Commission to request that it receive credit against future Tier 2 payments in an amount equal to the Tier 2 payments that should not have been made. Qwest may also request that the relevant portion of subsequent Tier 2 payments will not be owed until any responsible CLEC problems are corrected. For the purposes of this sub-section, Tier 1 performance measurements that have not been designated as Tier 2 will be aggregated and the aggregate results will be investigated pursuant to the terms of this agreement.

16.0 Reviews

Every six (6) months beginning six months after the effective date of 271 approval by the FCC for the state of South Dakota, Qwest, CLECs, and the Commission shall participate in a review of the performance measurements to determine whether the measurements should be added, deleted, or modified; whether the applicable benchmark standards should be modified or replaced by standards; and whether to move a classification of a measurement to High, Medium, or Low or Tier 1 to Tier 2. Criteria for review of performance measurement, other than for possible reclassification, shall be whether there exists an omission or failure to capture intended performance, and whether there is duplication of another measurement. After the Commission considers changes proposed in the six month review process, it shall determine what, if any, changes shall be made by Qwest. The Commission retains its independent authority under state law to initiate a proceeding to review the PAP at any time and to order changes to any provisions of the PAP, after notice and hearing, and consistent with due process and other rights of all parties. No new performance measurements shall be added to the PAP that have not been subject to observation as a diagnostic measurement for a period of six (6) months, unless ordered otherwise by the Commission. Any changes made pursuant to this section shall apply to and modify this agreement.

Deleted: 1st

- 16.1.1 Notwithstanding section 16.1, if any agreements on adding, modifying, deleting, performance measurements as permitted by section 16.1 are reached between Qwest and CLECs participating in an industry Regional Oversight Committee (ROC) PID administration forum, those agreements shall be incorporated into the QPAP and modify the agreement between CLEC and Qwest at any time those agreements are submitted to and approved by the Commission, whether before or after a six-month review.
- 16.1.2 Nothing in this PAP precludes the Commission from modifying the PAP based upon its independent state law authority, subject to judicial challenge. Nothing in this PAP constitutes a grant of authority by either party to this agreement nor does it constitute a waiver by either party to this agreement of any claim either party may have that the Commission lacks jurisdiction to make any modifications to this PAP, including any modifications resulting from the process described in Section 16.0.
- 16.2 Two years after the effective date of the first FCC 271 approval of the PAP, the Commission, by itself or in conjunction with other state commissions, may conduct a review by a independent third party to examine the continuing effectiveness of the PAP as a means of inducing compliant performance. Except for expenses which may be assigned under section 15.3, the expenses of any review by the state of South Dakota, or if the Commission participates in a multistate review, the expenses shall be paid first from the Tier 2 funds in the Special Fund. If no Special Fund is in existence or Tier 2 funds are not otherwise sufficient to cover audit costs in whole or in part, the Commission will develop an additional funding method that will include contribution from CLECs' Tier 1 payments and from Qwest.
- 16.3 Qwest will make the PAP available for CLEC interconnection agreements. Upon Qwest's elimination of its Section 272 affiliate or upon it exiting the interLATA market, Qwest may petition the Commission to phase out the PAP. At that time, a review of the PAP shall be conducted to determine whether a phase-out of the PAP is appropriate.
- 17.0 (Reserved for Future Use)

18.0 Dispute Resolution

Except as otherwise provided in the PAP, the Commission shall resolve any disputes.

-	Deleted: 1 ^{al}
ì	
d	Deleted: March 2

Attachment 1: Tier 1 and Tier 2 Performance Measurements Subject to Per Occurrence Payment

Performance Measurement	Tier 1 Payments		Tier	2 Payrr	nents]		
		Low	Med		Low	Med		
				High				
GATEWAY								
Timely Outage Resolution	GA-7						Χ	-
PRE-ORDER/ORDERS								
LSR Rejection Notice Interval	PO-3ª	X						
Firm Order Confirmations On Time	PO-5	X				X		
Work Completion Notification Timeliness	PO-6 ^b	X						,
Billing Completion Notification Timeliness	PO-7 ^b	X						4
Jeopardy Notice Interval	PO-8	X						-
Timely Jeopardy Notices	PO-9	X						-
Release Notifications	PO-16						X	-
Thologo Houndarons	1010	-						
ORDERING AND PROVISIONING							<u> </u>	
Installation Commitments Met	OP-3°			Х		Х		1
Installation Intervals	OP-4 ^d			X		X		
New Service Quality	OP-5a			X		X		B-Lite II II II II
Delayed Days	OP-6			X	 .	X		Deleted: Installation
Number Portability Timeliness	OP-8			X		X		
Coordinated Cuts On Time – Unbundled	OP-13a			X		X		
Loops	01-104			^		^		
LNP Disconnect Timeliness	OP-17	 		X		X		1
EN BISSONICS INTOINISS	01 17	1						
MAINTENANCE AND REPAIR		+						1
Out of Service Cleared within 24 hours	MR-3			Х				-
All Troubles Cleared within 4 hours	MR-5	·		X				1
Mean time to Restore	MR-			X				-
Wedn'thine to ricolors	6a,b,c							
Repair Repeat Report Rate	MR-7	1		Х		X		1
Trouble Rate	MR-8			X		X		1
LNP Trouble Reports Cleared within 24	MR-11			X		X		
Hours								
. '				-				
BILLING								1
Time to Provide Recorded Usage Records	BI-1	X					X	
Billing Accuracy-Adjustments for Errors	BI-3	X						1
Billing Completeness	BI-4	X				Х		
NETWORK PERFORMANCE								_
Trunk Blocking	NI-1			X			X	
NXX Code Activation	NP-1			Х			X]

a. PO-3 is limited to PO-3a-1, PO-3b-1, and PO-3c.

Deleted: 1*1	***************************************
Deleted: March 3	

Qwest South Dakota SGAT 4th Revision, 2nd Revised,

Exhibit K

October 31, 2003

Page 23

- b. PO-6 is included with PO-7 as two "families:" PO-6a/PO-7a and PO-6b/PO-7b. Measurements within each family share a single payment opportunity with only the measurements with the highest payment being paid.
- c.. OP-4 is included with OP-6 as five "families:" OP-4a/OP-6-1, OP-4b/OP-6-2, OP-4c/OP-6-3, OP-4d/OP-6-4, and OP-4e/OP-6-5. Measurements within each family share a single payment opportunity with only the measurement with the highest payment being paid.
- d. For purposes of the PAP, OP-6a and OP-6b will be combined and treated as one. The combined OP-6 breaks down to OP-6-1 (within MSA), OP-6-2 (outside MSA), OP-6-3 (no dispatch), OP-6-4 (zone 1), and OP-6-5 (zone 2).

400000000000000000000000000000000000000	
Deleted:	1 41
Deleted:	March 3

Attachment 2: Performance Measurements Subject to Per Measurement Caps

Billing

Time to Provide Recorded Usage Records – BI-1 (Tier 1/Tier 2) Billing Accuracy – Adjustments for Errors – BI-3 (Tier 1) Billing Completeness – BI-4 (Tier 1/Tier 2)

Deleted: 1⁵¹ Deleted: March 3

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA

IN THE	MATTER C	F THE A	NALYSI	S OF)	ORDER APPROVING
QWEST	CORPORA	ATION'S	COMPLI	ANCE)	REVISIONS TO QPAP
WITH	SECTION	271(c)	OF	THE)	
TELECO	MMUNICATION	ONS ACT	OF 1996)	TC01-165
)	

On November 3, 2003, the Public Utilities Commission (Commission) received from Qwest Corporation (Qwest) a Submission of OP-5(A) for Inclusion in the QPAP. Qwest requested that the Commission approve Exhibit K, which is the QPAP, as revised, make it effective no later than December 1, 2003, and, that pursuant to section 16 of the QPAP, the changes shall automatically apply to all existing interconnection agreements that currently contain Exhibit K as an exhibit.

In its filing, Qwest explained that the modifications to OP-5 were agreed to in the Long Term Pid Administration collaborative forum. OP-5(A) allows "any trouble reports that occur within thirty (30) days of completion of the service order to be matched with the original service order and to be reported in a more timely fashion."

The Commission considered this filing at its December 2, 2003, meeting. The Commission has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to SDCL Chapter 49-31. The Commission voted to grant the request. It is therefore

ORDERED, that the Commission approves the changes to the QPAP, with an effective date of December 1, 2003.

Dated at Pierre, South Dakota, this 17th day of December, 2003.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE
The undersigned hereby certifies that this document has been served today upon all parties of record in this docket, as listed on the docket service list, by facsimile or by first class mail, in properly addressed envelopes, with charges prepaid thereon. By:
Date: 12/19/03
(OFFICIAL SEAL)

BY ORDER OF THE COMMISSION:

ROBERT K. SAHR, Chairman

GARY HANSON Commissioner

AMES A. BURG, Commissioner