

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION  
OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA**

**IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION BY SCS CARBON TRANSPORT LLC FOR  
A PERMIT TO CONSTRUCT A CARBON DIOXIDE TRANSMISSION PIPELINE**

**SD PUC DOCKET NO. \_\_\_\_\_**

**PRE-FILED DIRECT TESTIMONY OF DR. MICHAEL LUMPKIN  
ON BEHALF OF SCS CARBON TRANSPORT LLC**

November 19, 2024

1 **Q. Please state your name and business address for the record.**

2 A. My name is Michael Harrison Lumpkin, PhD, DABT. I am a Senior Toxicologist with  
3 CTEH, LLC. My business address is 350 Indiana Street, Suite 700, Golden, CO 80401

4 **Q. Briefly describe your educational and professional background.**

5 A. I earned a Bachelor of Science degree in biochemistry from the University of Georgia in  
6 1994, and a Doctor of Philosophy degree in toxicology from the University of Georgia in  
7 2002. I am board-certified in general toxicology by the American Board of Toxicology. I  
8 have practiced toxicology for the past 22 years as a consultant and federal government  
9 contractor. I have extensive experience in dose reconstruction, chemical dose-response  
10 assessment, physiologically-based pharmacokinetic (PBPK) modeling, chemical  
11 emergency response, and product stewardship and safety assessments. I have  
12 developed, critiqued and applied PBPK models for multiple government agencies,  
13 including the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA), U.S. Centers for Disease  
14 Control and Prevention (CDC) and U.S. Department of Defense (DOD) and have co-  
15 authored numerous peer-reviewed hazard assessments for USEPA and the Agency for  
16 Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR).

17 **Q. What is the basis for your testimony?**

18 A. I have been engaged to provide consulting services and expertise to SCS Carbon  
19 Transport LLC regarding toxicology and human health risks related to acute carbon  
20 dioxide exposures that could potentially occur in the unlikely event of a carbon dioxide  
21 pipeline release.

22 **Q. WHAT IS THE PURPOSE OF YOUR DIRECT TESTIMONY?**

1 A. The purpose of my testimony is to provide information  
2 regarding the toxicological effects of acute (meaning short-term) carbon dioxide exposures  
3 at varying concentrations higher than typically found in ambient air. This testimony will  
4 inform the airborne concentrations to which first responders and the general public may  
5 be exposed over a period of minutes to a few hours without likelihood of adverse health  
6 effects that would result in inability to egress from the area or the development of transient  
7 or permanent toxic injury.

8 **Q. WHAT IS TOXICITY?**

9 A. Toxicity is the ability of a chemical to cause harm to biological tissues, organ systems, or  
10 individual organisms. It is widely accepted by toxicologists that there exists some dose or  
11 exposure level at which a substance changes from harmless to harmful to an organism.  
12 This harm may range from relatively mild and reversible to lethal. This is true for  
13 substances ranging from water (a requisite for all living organisms) to botulinum toxin (one  
14 of the most potent known neurotoxins).

15 **Q. HOW DOES THE HUMAN BODY RESPOND TO INHALATION OF A GAS SUCH AS**  
16 **OXYGEN OR CARBON DIOXIDE?**

17 A. Changes in the human body's physiological or biochemical conditions due to inhalation of  
18 oxygen, CO<sub>2</sub>, or other gases include a well-ordered sequence of biochemical adjustments.  
19 These adjustments are intended to establish or re-establish optimum use of energy  
20 sources so that bodily functions required for survival are maintained. In the case of normal  
21 CO<sub>2</sub> production within the body or inhalation of increasing CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations from  
22 ambient air, the body responds with neurological messaging that prompts shifts in  
23 breathing rates, blood pressure, and proportional blood flow to critical organ systems in  
24 an attempt to re-balance the delivery of oxygen and the removal of waste CO<sub>2</sub> from cells.  
25 This re-balancing process, called physiological compensation, occurs for many processes  
26 in the body in addition to oxygen and CO<sub>2</sub> transport and use. However, there are limitations

1 to the body's ability to compensate, after which further perturbations of oxygen or CO<sub>2</sub>  
2 inhalation and CO<sub>2</sub> elimination create conditions in blood and tissues that may not be  
3 conducive to normal function.

4 **Q. CAN YOU EXPLAIN THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN AMBIENT OXYGEN**  
5 **CONCENTRATION, HIGH CONCENTRATION ACUTE CARBON DIOXIDE**  
6 **EXPOSURE, AND HUMAN HEALTH EFFECTS?**

7 Yes. Normal ambient oxygen concentration is 20.9% of air, with the balance consisting  
8 primarily of nitrogen, water vapor, trace gases, and other gases and particulates present  
9 due to local geography or pollution conditions. Oxygen concentration needed for normal  
10 body function is at least 19.5% of inhaled air. As oxygen levels fall below 19.5%,  
11 physiological compensation results in higher breathing rates and higher cardiac output  
12 through increased pulse rate. However, as oxygen levels drop further, decreased physical  
13 coordination and impaired mental acuity increase. At oxygen levels of 6% to 10%, nausea,  
14 vomiting, and increasing lethargy increases markedly to the point of unconsciousness.  
15 Oxygen levels of less than 6% will result in cessation of breathing, convulsions, cardiac  
16 arrest, and death.

17 An increase of CO<sub>2</sub> in ambient air does not result in a 1-to-1 reduction of oxygen. CO<sub>2</sub> is  
18 heavier than oxygen and will physically displace oxygen depending on CO<sub>2</sub> concentration.  
19 However, CO<sub>2</sub> also displaces the other gases in ambient air to a greater or lesser extent  
20 than it displaces oxygen. For example, assuming minimal water vapor and trace gas  
21 content in air, 100,000 ppm CO<sub>2</sub> (a 10% CO<sub>2</sub> atmosphere) would result in an approximate  
22 oxygen level of 18.8% under standard conditions of temperature and pressure. A CO<sub>2</sub>  
23 atmosphere of 300,000 ppm (30%) would result in an approximate oxygen level of 14.6%  
24 under standard conditions.

25 In the body, CO<sub>2</sub> is a natural byproduct (along with water) formed by metabolism. The  
26 presence of sufficiently high CO<sub>2</sub> in blood can result in lowering of blood pH from its typical  
27 neutral value of 7.4 to more acidic levels. The blood has systems to maintain a neutral

1 blood pH. However, excessively high levels of an acidic compound in blood can result in  
2 a continuous acidic condition called acidosis. Blood acidosis triggers signals from the brain  
3 to increase the ability of the lungs to eliminate CO<sub>2</sub> via exhalation. Results of these  
4 changes in respiratory properties include changes in blood pressure, increased respiratory  
5 rate, and increased heart rate. All these changes act together to transport more CO<sub>2</sub> from  
6 the cells, through the circulatory system, and to the lungs where it may leave the lung  
7 blood to the lung air spaces, resulting in a net reduction of blood v and a return toward  
8 neutral blood pH.

9 **A. ARE THERE PUBLISHED SCIENTIFIC STUDIES REGARDING THE POTENTIAL**  
10 **HEALTH EFFECTS OF HIGH CONCENTRATION ACUTE CO<sub>2</sub> EXPOSURE?**

11 Q. Yes, numerous case reports and studies of volunteers and lab animals contain data on  
12 the effect of high concentration acute (up to a few hours) CO<sub>2</sub> exposures. Many of these  
13 published studies were conducted in the early to mid-1900's. Several of these studies are  
14 limited by details regarding the actual CO<sub>2</sub> and oxygen composition of the test  
15 atmospheres (in the case of experimental studies) or presence of other unmeasured toxic  
16 gases (in the case of occupational case reports of injuries and fatalities). Further, these  
17 studies reported rather inconsistent results, with some studies suggesting loss of  
18 coordination, dizziness and headaches following exposures of 5,000 to 10,000 ppm while  
19 others reported no ill effects from acute and longer duration exposures up to 30,000 ppm.  
20 Similarly, some reported exposures at or more than 100,000 ppm indicated lethargy and  
21 transient loss of consciousness, while others reported death at these same  
22 concentrations. While some study authors have suggested that possible blood acidosis  
23 may have led to disruption of electrolyte balance (particularly potassium levels in blood),  
24 the details in reporting are lacking to verify this impact. Many authors have opined that the  
25 observed effects described in their respective studies are due to "CO<sub>2</sub> toxicity"; however,  
26 it is difficult to determine if the observed effects were a result of oxygen deficiency, actual

1 overwhelming of the subjects' blood buffering capabilities, or neurological stimulation of  
2 cardiopulmonary changes resulting in secondary effects on mental acuity, coordination, or  
3 headaches.

4 These older studies reporting no adverse effects in submariners breathing 30,000 ppm  
5 CO<sub>2</sub> to unconsciousness in persons breathing 100,000 ppm inform the current National  
6 Institute for Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH) Immediately Dangerous to Life and  
7 Health (IDLH) limit of 40,000 ppm for healthy people. A NIOSH IDLH limit is an air  
8 concentration at or below which healthy workers may be exposed for 60 minutes without  
9 risk of permanent harm to health or ability to escape.

10 Newer data for CO<sub>2</sub> inhalation in humans and laboratory rodents provide a better  
11 understanding of physiological compensation and toxicity occurring from increasing levels  
12 of CO<sub>2</sub> exposure. The most detailed and recent study on the subject is by van der Schrier,  
13 et al. (2022) (the "van der Schrier Study"). The study authors reported CO<sub>2</sub> exposures  
14 from 60,000 to 120,000 ppm (or 6% to 12% CO<sub>2</sub>atmosphere) to healthy male volunteers.  
15 The volunteers were exposed for up to one hour. The inspired oxygen levels ranged from  
16 19.7% down to 18.4% as CO<sub>2</sub> exposure levels increased. In the same study publication,  
17 rats were exposed from 100,000 to 500,000 ppm CO<sub>2</sub> for up to one hour. At the conclusion  
18 of the rat exposures or at the time of death, rats were necropsied for examination of  
19 organs, including the lungs. The blood pH values from the human and rat data were used  
20 together to develop a mathematical model that could translate (or predict) human and rat  
21 blood pH changes over time given various CO<sub>2</sub> inhalation exposures. This is the first time  
22 such an intraspecies model of CO<sub>2</sub>-induced blood pH changes has been reported.

23 The human and rat data were complimentary, moving from sub-100,000 ppm exposures  
24 to up to 500,000 ppm exposures. The human subjects showed high tolerability of 60-  
25 minute exposures to up to 75,000 ppm and 10-minutes at 90,000 ppm. Blood pH levels  
26 decreased over time at all exposure levels but reached an equilibrium of no less than 7.2

1 at exposure levels up to 90,000 ppm (blood pH has a typical neutral value of 7.4).  
2 Transient changes to cardiac parameters and mental acuity were reported, indicating  
3 physiological compensation to increase blood elimination of CO<sub>2</sub>. Exposures to 100,000  
4 and 120,000 ppm were stopped early due to subject irritability, anxiety, or loss of  
5 consciousness. However, all subjects completely recovered in all aspects within minutes  
6 of exposure cessation.

7 **Q. WHAT CONCLUSIONS DO YOU DRAW FROM THE VAN DER SCHRIER**  
8 **STUDY?**

9 Prior to the publication of the van der Schrier Study, it was difficult to use data from earlier  
10 studies and case reports in humans to distinguish the effects caused by non-toxic  
11 physiological compensation to blood CO<sub>2</sub> burdens or actual toxic harm. The detailed  
12 effects reported for humans and animals in the van der Schrier Study indicate a lack of  
13 toxic effect and the ability to make escape-related decisions for exposures between  
14 75,000 and 90,000 ppm in typical, healthy individuals.

15 The database for inhaled CO<sub>2</sub> effects at levels from 2,000 ppm to less than 100,000 ppm  
16 are often missing sufficient detail to tease out toxic versus compensatory effects in  
17 humans. However, the 2022 study by van der Schrier and colleagues in humans and rats  
18 provides new details into acute CO<sub>2</sub> tolerability and toxicity for both species. The van der  
19 Schrier Study is a study of sufficient quality on which to base the classification of acutely  
20 inhaled CO<sub>2</sub> exposures of less than 100,000 ppm as non-toxic and suggests revisiting the  
21 present NIOSH limit of 40,000 ppm for healthy people.

22 **Q. DO YOU HAVE REAL-WORLD EXPERIENCE RESPONDING TO EXPOSURES OF**  
23 **CO<sub>2</sub> FROM CO<sub>2</sub> PIPELINE RELEASES?**

24 **A.** Yes. I was the lead toxicologist at CTEH responding to the carbon dioxide pipeline release  
25 in 2020 near Satartia, Mississippi. I arrived in Satartia on February 23, 2020, to support  
26 the incident command during a community meeting held at the First Baptist Church of  
27 Satartia. During the meeting, I briefed the community on the CTEH air monitoring data

1 collection to date and explained the basic toxicology of acute carbon dioxide and hydrogen  
2 sulfide exposure. I answered community members' questions during and immediately  
3 following the meeting. Over the next several days, I was available to meet and answer  
4 toxicology questions of community members who came to the Satartia City Hall. Several  
5 community members, including first responders, gave account of their whereabouts and  
6 health effect experiences in the evening of February 22, 2020. Health effects described to  
7 me ranged from no noticeable effects to transient lightheadedness, dizziness, and short-  
8 term loss of consciousness.

9 **Q. HOW DO THE HEALTH EFFECTS REPORTED TO YOU BY PERSONS IN SATARTIA**  
10 **COMPARE TO THE SCIENTIFIC LITRATURE ON THE SUBJECT?**

11  
12 A. The experiences conveyed to me by community members and first responders who were  
13 in Satartia on the evening of February 22, 2020, are consistent with transient effects  
14 reported in the scientific literature for acute CO<sub>2</sub> exposure. Subjective effects reported to  
15 me such as momentary lightheadedness and subsequent headache are consistent with  
16 known physiological compensation of the circulatory system to adjust cerebral blood flow  
17 for increased elimination of carbon dioxide from the body. These same subjective effects,  
18 in my experience as a responding toxicologist, are also common in populations that are  
19 reacting to and/or evacuating from a reported chemical release incident, reflecting an  
20 individual's physiological response to a real or perceived hazardous situation.

21 **Q. IN YOUR PROFESSIONAL OPINION, IS THERE UNDUE RISK TO HUMAN HEALTH**  
22 **FROM CO2 EXPSOURE WHEN CONSIDERING THE PROBABILITY OF A PIPELINE**  
23 **RELEASE OCCURING?**

24 A. In my professional opinion, as a toxicologist and human health risk assessor, the risk of  
25 actual toxicological harm or a reduced capacity to escape is small. Based on best available  
26 science on the physiological and toxicological effects of acute carbon dioxide exposure,  
27 inhalation of at least 75,000 ppm carbon dioxide by healthy individuals is unlikely to result  
28 in harm or reduction in decision making capacity. My review of risk modeling of pipeline  
29 incidence performed for the SCS-proposed pipeline routes, which integrates air dispersion



1 modeling for 40,000 ppm and 80,000 ppm concentration buffers, informs my opinion that  
2 there is no undue risk of adverse effects to human health from the operation of the  
3 proposed Summit SCS pipeline system.

4  
5  
6  
7

8 **Q. Does this conclude your testimony?**

9 A. Yes.

10

11 Dated this 19<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2024.

12

13 /s/ Dr. Michael Harrison Lumpkin

14 Michael Harrison Lumpkin, PhD, DABT