

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA**

**IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION
OF TRANSCANADA KEYSTONE
PIPELINE, LP FOR ORDER
ACCEPTING CERTIFICATION OF
PERMIT ISSUED IN DOCKET HP09-
001 TO CONSTRUCT THE KEYSTONE
XL PIPELINE**

*
*
*
*
*
*
*
*

**STAFF'S RESPONSE TO JOINT
MOTION TO DISMISS**

HP14-001

COMES NOW Staff ("Staff") of the South Dakota Public Utilities Commission ("Commission") and hereby files this Response to Joint Motion to Dismiss. On November 9, 2015, the Commission received a Motion to Dismiss from several intervenors. In the Motion, Movants request first that the current certification proceeding be dismissed, and second, that that permit issued in HP09-001 be revoked. Staff first addresses the request for revocation, as the request for dismissal would be moot should the permit be revoked.

I. Request for Revocation of Permit

A. The request to revoke is not properly before the Commission.

Movants request the Commission revoke the permit pursuant to SDCL 49-41B-33. However, the permit was not issued in this docket; therefore, a request to revoke the permit is not appropriately before the Commission. The service list for HP09-001 is noticeably different from that for the current docket. Thus, very few of the parties to the permitting docket received proper notice of the request for revocation. While there is no precedent, as the Commission has never before been asked to revoke a permit, it stands to reason that a motion to revoke could only be brought in the docket in which the permit was granted.

B. Even if the Commission chooses to address revocation in this docket, revocation is not merited.

Movants urge the Commission to revoke the permit for the Keystone XL pipeline based solely on the fact that the Presidential Permit was denied. Staff acknowledges that the Presidential Permit was denied on November 6, 2015. Staff also acknowledges that the Applicant is required under Condition 3 to obtain a Presidential Permit. However, the November 6 denial does not render Keystone incapable of complying with Condition 3. The most telling evidence of this is the fact that this is the second time the Presidential Permit has been denied. Nowhere in the conditions did the Commission specify when the Presidential Permit must be obtained or prohibit the Applicant from making numerous attempts to obtain such a permit. The Commission simply ordered that construction may not begin until a Presidential Permit is obtained.

With that in mind, no harm can come from denying the request to revoke the permit at this time. Because the Applicant has not obtained a Presidential Permit, construction may not begin. On the other hand, a great deal of prejudice would be suffered if the permit was to be revoked and the Applicant later obtained a Presidential Permit. Parties to HP09-001 participated in several months of preparation and three days of hearings. The Commission drafted a thirty-nine page order. In this docket, parties participated in dozens of motions and nine days of hearings. Thousands of pages of discovery were shared. To now revoke the permit and run the risk of having to go through the entire process again is highly prejudicial to those who have put so much time into this process.

It is also important to note that no complaint has been filed against TransCanada with respect to the Keystone XL permit. In fact, in the nearly eight years that TransCanada has been active in South Dakota¹, no formal complaints have been filed with the Commission against the company.

Certainly, while the second denial of a Presidential Permit might make compliance with the conditions less likely, it does not make compliance impossible. Moreover, unless and until the Applicant attempts to construct or operate the Keystone XL pipeline in South Dakota without a Presidential Permit, the Applicant has not violated the condition that it obtain a Presidential Permit.

II. Motion to Dismiss Certification Proceeding

When the intervenors filed their Motion for Stay in April of 2015, they argued that it was “purely judicial economy.” Transcript (hereafter “ST”) 10:15, 11:14-16, 15:11-12, 16:17-18. This also is purely an issue of judicial economy. In that hearing, the intervenors went on to caution the Commission to take “a careful look at how we’re spending other people’s money.” ST 11:16-17.

Well over a year has gone into this docket. As Staff discussed above, Keystone could ultimately obtain a Presidential Permit. It would be nonsensical to go through another year, spending the time and money to litigate the same issues should that permit be granted in the future. The risk of having to go through a second proceeding does nothing to aid judicial economy and, in fact, risks harm to those who may not have the financial means to relitigate this proceeding. It is entirely possible that Staff would not have the means to hire expert witnesses

¹ TransCanada also owns the Keystone I pipeline, upon which it began construction in 2008. This information is available in Docket No. HP07-001.

should this matter be dismissed and refiled. Staff relies on a filing fee set by statute to process these types of dockets.² Staff would be greatly prejudiced should that fee be depleted and Staff be unable to seek outside assistance.

When it ruled to deny the Motion for Stay, the Commission stated that “we have a responsibility again to go through the process.” ST 28:15-16. The Commission went on to state that the docket would proceed “[regardless] of what the federal government may or may not be doing on this particular account.” ST 29:24-25, 30:1. These statements are no less true than they were in April.

In the interest of judicial economy and to avoid prejudice, Staff recommends the Motion to Dismiss be denied.

Dated this 8th day of December, 2015.



Kristen N. Edwards
Staff Attorney
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission
500 East Capitol Avenue
Pierre, SD 57501

² See Order Assessing Filing Fee dated October 1, 2014.

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA**

**IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF)
TRANSCANADA KEYSTONE PIPELINE, LP)
FOR ORDER ACCEPTING CERTIFICATION)
OF PERMIT ISSUED IN DOCKET HP09-001)
TO CONSTRUCT THE KEYSTONE XL)
PIPELINE)**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

HP14-001

I hereby certify that true and correct copies of Staff's Response to Joint Motion to Dismiss and Certificate of Service were served electronically to the Parties listed below, on the 8th day of December, 2015, addressed to:

Ms. Patricia Van Gerpen
Executive Director
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission
500 E. Capitol Ave.
Pierre, SD 57501
patty.vangerpen@state.sd.us

Ms. Kristen Edwards
Staff Attorney
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission
500 E. Capitol Ave.
Pierre, SD 57501
Kristen.edwards@state.sd.us

Mr. Brian Rounds
Staff Analyst
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission
500 E. Capitol Ave.
Pierre, SD 57501
brian.rounds@state.sd.us

Mr. Darren Kearney
Staff Analyst
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission
500 E. Capitol Ave.
Pierre, SD 57501
darren.kearney@state.sd.us

Mr. James P. White
Attorney
TransCanada Keystone Pipeline, LP
Ste. 225
1250 Eye St., NW
Washington, DC 20005
jim_p_white@transcanada.com

Mr. James E. Moore
Attorney
Woods, Fuller, Shultz and Smith P.C.
PO Box 5027
Sioux Falls, SD 57117
james.moore@woodsfuller.com

Mr. William G. Taylor
Attorney
Taylor Law Firm
2921 E. 57th St. #10
Sioux Falls, SD 57108
bill.taylor@williamgtaylor.com
(605) 212-1750 – voice

Mr. Paul F. Seamans
27893 249th St.
Draper, SD 57531
jackknife@goldenwest.net

Mr. John H. Harter
28125 307th Ave.
Winner, SD 57580
johnharter11@yahoo.com

Ms. Elizabeth Lone Eagle
PO Box 160
Howes, SD 57748
bethcbest@gmail.com

Mr. Tony Rogers
Rosebud Sioux Tribe - Tribal Utility
Commission
153 S. Main St.
Mission, SD 57555
tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov

Ms. Viola Waln
PO Box 937
Rosebud, SD 57570
waln ranch@goldenwest.net

031422

Ms. Jane KleeB
Bold Nebraska
1010 N. Denver Ave.
Hastings, NE 68901
jane@boldnebraska.org

Mr. Benjamin D. Gotschall
Bold Nebraska
6505 W. Davey Rd.
Raymond, NE 68428
ben@boldnebraska.org

Mr. Byron T. & Ms. Diana L. Steskal
707 E. 2nd St.
Stuart NE 68780
prairierose@nntc.net

Ms. Cindy Myers, R.N.
PO Box 104
Stuart, NE 68780
csmyers77@hotmail.com

Mr. Arthur R. Tanderup
52343 857th Rd.
Neligh, NE 68756
atanderu@gmail.com

Mr. Lewis GrassRope
PO Box 61
Lower Brule, SD 57548
wisestar8@msn.com
(605) 208-0606 - voice

Ms. Carolyn P. Smith
305 N. 3rd St.
Plainview, NE 68769
peachie_1234@yahoo.com

Mr. Robert G. Allpress
46165 Badger Rd.
Naper, NE 68755
bobandnan2008@hotmail.com
(402) 832-5298 - voice

Mr. Louis T. Genung
902 E. 7th St.
Hastings, NE 68901
tq64152@windstream.net

Mr. Peter Capossela, P.C.
Attorney at Law
PO Box 10643
Eugene, OR 97440
pcapossela@nu-world.com

Ms. Nancy Hilding
6300 W. Elm
Black Hawk, SD 57718
nhilshat@rapidnet.com

Mr. Gary F. Dorr
27853 292nd
Winner, SD 57580
gfdorr@gmail.com

Mr. Bruce & Ms. RoxAnn Boettcher
Boettcher Organics
86061 Edgewater Ave.
Bassett, NE 68714
boettcherann@abbnebraska.com

Ms. Wrexie Lainson Bardaglio
9748 Arden Rd.
Trumansburg, NY 14886
wrexie.bardaglio@gmail.com
(607) 229-8819 - voice

Mr. William Kindle
President
Rosebud Sioux Tribe
PO Box 430
Rosebud, SD 57570
William.Kindle@rst-nsn.gov
ejantoine@hotmail.com

Mr. Eric Antoine
Attorney
Rosebud Sioux Tribe
PO Box 430
Rosebud, SD 57570
ejantoine@hotmail.com

Ms. Paula Antoine
Sicangu Oyate Land Office Coordinator
Rosebud Sioux Tribe
PO Box 658
Rosebud, SD 57570
wopila@qwtc.net
paula.antoine@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov

Mr. Harold C. Frazier
Chairman
Cheyenne River Sioux Tribe
PO Box 590
Eagle Butte, SD 57625
haroldcfrazier@yahoo.com

Ms. Amy Schaffer
PO Box 114
Louisville, NE 68037
amyannschafter@gmail.com

Ms. Debbie J. Trapp
24952 US HWY 14
Midland, SD 57552
mtdt@goldenwest.net

Ms. Gena M. Parkhurst
2825 Minnewasta Place
Rapid City, SD 57702
gmp66@hotmail.com

Ms. Joye Braun
PO Box 484
Eagle Butte, SD 57625
jmbraun57625@gmail.com

Mr. Robert Flying Hawk
Chairman
Yankton Sioux Tribe
PO Box 1153
Wagner, SD 57380
Robertflyinghawk@gmail.com

Ms. Thomasina Real Bird
Attorney
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan LLP
1900 Plaza Dr.
Louisville, CO 80027
trealbird@ndnlaw.com

Ms. Chastity Jewett
1321 Woodridge Dr.
Rapid City, SD 57701
chasjewett@gmail.com

Mr. Duncan Meisel
350.org
20 Jay St. #1010
Brooklyn, NY 11201
duncan@350.org

Ms. Sabrina King
Dakota Rural Action
518 Sixth Street, #6
Rapid City, SD 57701
sabrina@dakotarural.org

Mr. Frank James
Dakota Rural Action
PO Box 549
Brookings, SD 57006
fejames@dakotarural.org

Mr. Bruce Ellison
Attorney
Dakota Rural Action
518 Sixth St. #6
Rapid City, SD 57701
belli4law@aol.com

Mr. Tom BK Goldtooth
Indigenous Environmental Network (IEN)
PO Box 485
Bemidji, MN 56619
ien@igc.org

Mr. Dallas Goldtooth
38371 Res. HWY 1
Morton, MN 56270
goldtoothdallas@gmail.com

Ms. Bonny Kilmurry
47798 888 Rd.
Atkinson, NE 68713
bjkilmurry@gmail.com

Mr. Robert P. Gough
Secretary
Intertribal Council on Utility Policy
PO Box 25
Rosebud, SD 57570
bobgough@intertribalCOUP.org

Mr. Terry & Cheryl Frisch
47591 875th Rd.
Atkinson, NE 68713
tcfrisch@q.com

Ms. Tracey Zephier
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan LLP
Ste. 101
520 Kansas City St.
Rapid City, SD 57701
tzeplier@ndnlaw.com

Mr. Travis Clark
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan LLP
Ste. 101
520 Kansas City St.
Rapid City, SD 57701
tclark@ndnlaw.com

Mr. Robin S. Martinez
The Martinez Law Firm, LLC
616 W. 26th St.
Kansas City, MO 64108
robin.martinez@martinezlawn.net

Ms. Mary Turgeon Wynne, Esq.
Rosebud Sioux Tribe - Tribal Utility
Commission
153 S. Main St
Mission, SD 57555
tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov

Mr. Matthew L. Rappold
Rappold Law Office
816 Sixth St.
PO Box 873
Rapid City, SD 57709
Matt.rappold01@gmail.com

Mr. Paul C. Blackburn
Attorney
4145 20th Ave. South
Minneapolis, MN 55407
paul@paulblackburn.net

Ms. Kimberly E. Craven
Attorney
3560 Catalpa Way
Boulder, CO 80304
kimecraven@gmail.com

And on December 8, 2015, a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was mailed via U.S. Mail, first class postage prepaid, to the following:

Mr. Cody Jones
21648 US HWY 14/63
Midland, SD 57552

Mr. Ronald Fees
17401 Fox Ridge Rd.
Opal, SD 57758

Mr. Jerry Jones
22584 US HWY 14
Midland SD 57552

Ms. Elizabeth Lone Eagle
PO Box 160
Howes, SD 57748

/s/ Kristen N. Edwards
Kristen N. Edwards
Staff Attorney
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission
500 East Capitol
Pierre, SD 57501