



Gary Hanson, Chairperson  
Chris Nelson, Vice Chairperson  
Kristie Fiegen, Commissioner



## PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

500 East Capitol Avenue  
Pierre, South Dakota 57501-5070  
[www.puc.sd.gov](http://www.puc.sd.gov)

Capitol Office  
(605) 773-3201  
1-866-757-6031 fax

Grain Warehouse  
(605) 773-5280  
(605) 773-3225 fax

Consumer Hotline  
1-800-332-1782

December 29, 2014

Ms. Patricia Van Gerpen, Executive Director  
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
500 E. Capitol Ave.  
Pierre, SD 57501

**RE: HP14-001, Commission Staff's Response to Yankton Sioux Tribe's Motion to Dismiss**

Dear Ms. Van Gerpen:

Attached, please find Commission Staff's Response to Yankton Sioux Tribe's Motion to Dismiss. The same is being served on all parties by copy of this correspondence.

Thank you for your time and attention to this filing. Should you have any questions, please feel free to contact me.

Sincerely,

Kristen N. Edwards  
Staff Attorney

Enc.  
Cc: Service List

001563

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION  
OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA**

---

**IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION  
OF TRANSCANADA KEYSTONE  
PIPELINE, LP FOR ORDER  
ACCEPTING CERTIFICATION OF  
PERMIT ISSUED IN DOCKET HP09-  
001 TO CONSTRUCT THE KEYSTONE  
XL PIPELINE**

---

\*  
\*  
\*  
\*  
\*  
\*  
\*  
\*

**COMMISSION STAFF'S RESPONSE  
TO YANKTON SIOUX TRIBE'S  
MOTION TO DISMISS  
  
HP14-001**

COMES NOW, Staff (Staff) of the South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
(Commission), by and through its undersigned counsel, and hereby files this Response to  
Yankton Sioux Tribe's Motion to Dismiss.

On December 2, 2014, Yankton Sioux Tribe filed a Motion to Dismiss pursuant to SDCL  
15-6-12(b)(5), arguing the Applicant, TransCanada Keystone Pipeline, LP (Keystone) failed to  
state a claim upon which relief can be granted. In its Motion, Yankton Sioux Tribe alleges that  
the thirty differences described in Keystone's Appendix C render the subject of this proceeding a  
different project than was permitted in HP09-001 and, therefore, ineligible for certification.

While Staff does not take a position at this time on whether or not each of the individual  
updates described in Keystone's Appendix C constitute a change in conditions, Staff does take  
the position that it would not be appropriate to grant the Motion to Dismiss at this time.

**ARGUMENT**

The certification proceeding in question was brought pursuant to SDCL 49-41B-27,  
which requires the Applicant who has received a permit to certify that the project continues to  
meet the conditions upon which the permit was granted if construction has not commenced  
within four years of issuance of the permit. To dispose of the issue of whether the project  
continues to meet those conditions on a Motion to Dismiss would render meaningless the entire

process of certification by establishing that any changes to a project would prevent an Applicant from reaching the point of an evidentiary hearing. The appropriate time in which to address whether there have been material changes which would preclude the project from receiving certification of its permit is at the evidentiary hearing, following an opportunity for discovery.


Should the Commission choose to consider at this point whether any of the updates identified in Exhibit C constitute grounds for dismissal, Staff urges the Commission not take the position that every change constitutes an inability to meet the conditions upon which the permit was issued. Depending on the facts presented throughout the course of discovery and the evidentiary hearing, changes may be deemed immaterial. If that proves to be the case, a different project would not exist, as Yankton Sioux Tribe asserts. It is expected that changes will occur over a period of four years, and the Legislature must have known that at the time SDCL 49-41B-27 was passed. Surely the Legislature did not intend for a complete bar to certification by establishing a standard that no project could satisfy. For example, one such change that was noted by Keystone and would likely apply to any project that was dormant for four years was an increase in cost. While the Commission should consider this at the evidentiary hearing to determine whether the increase in cost constitutes an inability to meet the conditions upon which the permit was issued, it should not be a *per se* barrier to certification. In many cases, such as a case of increased cost, to interpret the statute so narrowly would lead to an absurd result by nullifying the statute, as likely no project could ever satisfy the requirement that absolutely nothing change, nor cost increase. “It is presumed that the Legislature [does] not intend for an absurd or unreasonable result.” *Krukow v. S.D. Bd. Of Pardons*, 2006 SD 46, ¶ 12, 716 N.W.2d 121, 124.

Furthermore, while this Commission is not bound by precedent, it is noteworthy that in past certification dockets, some project updates were present. In Docket No. EL12-063, the Commission granted certification of an electric transmission line that was granted a construction permit in 2007. In the time between the granting of the permit and application for certification in that docket, certain aspects of the project and circumstances surrounding the project, such as the size and the presence of a federal nexus, had changed. However, the Commission found that the project nonetheless continued to meet the conditions upon which the permit was granted, and certification was approved.

### **CONCLUSION**

For the above-mentioned reasons, Staff respectfully requests the Commission deny Yankton Sioux Tribe's Motion to Dismiss. This will allow the parties to conduct discovery to determine whether the project does continue to meet the conditions upon which the permit was granted.

Dated this 29<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2014.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Kristen N. Edwards  
Staff Attorney  
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
500 East Capitol Avenue  
Pierre, SD 57501

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION  
OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA**

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF )  
TRANSCANADA KEYSTONE PIPELINE, LP )  
FOR ORDER ACCEPTING CERTIFICATION )  
OF PERMIT ISSUED IN DOCKET HP09-001 )  
TO CONSTRUCT THE KEYSTONE XL )  
PIPELINE )

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

**HP14-001**

I hereby certify that true and correct copies of **Commission Staff's Response to Yankton Sioux Tribe's Motion to Dismiss** and Certificate of Service were served electronically to the Parties listed below, on the 29<sup>th</sup> day of December, 2014, addressed to:

Ms. Patricia Van Gerpen  
Executive Director  
South Dakota Public Utilities  
Commission  
500 E. Capitol Ave.  
Pierre, SD 57501  
[patty.vangerpen@state.sd.us](mailto:patty.vangerpen@state.sd.us)

Mr. Brian Rounds  
Staff Analyst  
South Dakota Public Utilities  
Commission  
500 E. Capitol Ave.  
Pierre, SD 57501  
[brian.rounds@state.sd.us](mailto:brian.rounds@state.sd.us)

Mr. Darren Kearney  
Staff Analyst  
South Dakota Public Utilities  
Commission  
500 E. Capitol Ave.  
Pierre, SD 57501  
[darren.kearney@state.sd.us](mailto:darren.kearney@state.sd.us)

Mr. James E. Moore - Representing:  
TransCanada Keystone Pipeline, LP  
Attorney  
Woods, Fuller, Shultz and Smith P.C.  
PO Box 5027  
Sioux Falls, SD 57117  
[james.moore@woodsfuller.com](mailto:james.moore@woodsfuller.com)

Mr. Bill G. Taylor  
Woods, Fuller, Shultz and Smith P.C.  
PO Box 5027  
Sioux Falls, SD 57117  
[bill.taylor@woodsfuller.com](mailto:bill.taylor@woodsfuller.com)

Mr. Paul F. Seamans  
27893 249th St.  
Draper, SD 57531  
[jackknife@goldenwest.net](mailto:jackknife@goldenwest.net)

Mr. John H. Harter  
28125 307th Ave.  
Winner, SD 57580  
[johnharter11@yahoo.com](mailto:johnharter11@yahoo.com)

Ms. Elizabeth Lone Eagle  
PO Box 160  
Howes, SD 57748  
[bethcbest@gmail.com](mailto:bethcbest@gmail.com)

Mr. Tony Rogers  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe - Tribal Utility  
Commission  
153 S. Main St.  
Mission, SD 57555  
[tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov](mailto:tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov)

Ms. Viola Waln  
PO Box 937  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[walnranh@goldenwest.net](mailto:walnranh@goldenwest.net)

Ms. Jane Kleeb  
Bold Nebraska  
1010 N. Denver Ave.  
Hastings, NE 68901  
[jane@boldnebraska.org](mailto:jane@boldnebraska.org)

Mr. Benjamin D. Gotschall  
Bold Nebraska  
6505 W. Davey Rd.  
Raymond, NE 68428  
[ben@boldnebraska.org](mailto:ben@boldnebraska.org)

Mr. Byron T. Steskal & Ms. Diana L. Steskal  
707 E. 2nd St.  
Stuart NE 68780  
[prairierose@nntc.net](mailto:prairierose@nntc.net)

Ms. Cindy Myers, R.N.  
PO Box 104  
Stuart, NE 68780  
[csmyers77@hotmail.com](mailto:csmyers77@hotmail.com)

Mr. Arthur R. Tanderup  
52343 857th Rd.  
Neligh, NE 68756  
[atanderu@gmail.com](mailto:atanderu@gmail.com)

Mr. Lewis GrassRope  
PO Box 61  
Lower Brule, SD 57548  
[wisestar8@msn.com](mailto:wisestar8@msn.com)

Ms. Carolyn P. Smith  
305 N. 3rd St.  
Plainview, NE 68769  
[peachie\\_1234@yahoo.com](mailto:peachie_1234@yahoo.com)

Mr. Robert G. Allpress  
46165 Badger Rd.  
Naper, NE 68755  
[bobandnan2008@hotmail.com](mailto:bobandnan2008@hotmail.com)

Mr. Jeff Jensen  
14376 Laflin Rd.  
Newell, SD 57760  
[jensen@sdplains.com](mailto:jensen@sdplains.com)

Mr. Louis T. Genung  
902 E. 7th St.  
Hastings, NE 68901  
[tg64152@windstream.net](mailto:tg64152@windstream.net)

Mr. Peter Capossela, P.C.  
Attorney at Law  
PO Box 10643  
Eugene, OR 97440  
[pcapossela@nu-world.com](mailto:pcapossela@nu-world.com)

Ms. Nancy Hilding  
6300 W. Elm  
Black Hawk, SD 57718  
[nhilshat@rapidnet.com](mailto:nhilshat@rapidnet.com)

Mr. Gary F. Dorr  
27853 292nd  
Winner, SD 57580  
[gfdorr@gmail.com](mailto:gfdorr@gmail.com)

Mr. Bruce & Ms. RoxAnn Boettcher  
Boettcher Organics  
86061 Edgewater Ave.  
Bassett, NE 68714  
[boettcherann@abbnebraska.com](mailto:boettcherann@abbnebraska.com)

Ms. Wrexie Lainson Bardaglio  
9748 Arden Rd.  
Trumansburg, NY 14886  
[wrexie.bardaglio@gmail.com](mailto:wrexie.bardaglio@gmail.com)

Mr. Cyril Scott  
President  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 430  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[cscott@gwtc.net](mailto:cscott@gwtc.net)  
[ejantoine@hotmail.com](mailto:ejantoine@hotmail.com)

Mr. Eric Antoine  
Attorney  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 430  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[ejantoine@hotmail.com](mailto:ejantoine@hotmail.com)

Ms. Paula Antoine  
Sicangu Oyate Land Office Coordinator  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 658  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[wopila@gwtc.net](mailto:wopila@gwtc.net)  
[paula.antoine@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov](mailto:paula.antoine@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov)

Mr. Chris Hesla  
South Dakota Wildlife Federation  
PO Box 7075  
Pierre, SD 57501  
[sdwf@mncomm.com](mailto:sdwf@mncomm.com)

Mr. Harold C. Frazier  
Chairman  
Cheyenne River Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 590  
Eagle Butte, SD 57625  
[haroldcfrazier@yahoo.com](mailto:haroldcfrazier@yahoo.com)

Ms. Amy Schaffer  
PO Box 114  
Louisville, NE 68037  
[amyannschafter@gmail.com](mailto:amyannschafter@gmail.com)

Ms. Debbie J. Trapp  
24952 US HWY 14  
Midland, SD 57552  
[mtdt@goldenwest.net](mailto:mtdt@goldenwest.net)

Ms. Gena M. Parkhurst  
2825 Minnewasta Place  
Rapid City, SD 57702  
[gmp66@hotmail.com](mailto:gmp66@hotmail.com)

Ms. Joye Braun  
PO Box 484  
Eagle Butte, SD 57625  
[jmbraun57625@gmail.com](mailto:jmbraun57625@gmail.com)

Mr. Robert Flying Hawk  
Chairman  
Yankton Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 1153  
Wagner, SD 57380  
[Robertflyinghawk@gmail.com](mailto:Robertflyinghawk@gmail.com)

Ms. Thomasina Real Bird  
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan LLP  
1900 Plaza Dr.  
Louisville, CO 80027  
[trealbird@ndnlaw.com](mailto:trealbird@ndnlaw.com)

Ms. Chastity Jewett  
1321 Woodridge Dr.  
Rapid City, SD 57701  
[chasjewett@gmail.com](mailto:chasjewett@gmail.com)

Mr. Douglas Hayes  
Sierra Club  
Ste. 102W  
1650 38th St.  
Boulder, CO 80301  
[doug.hayes@sierraclub.org](mailto:doug.hayes@sierraclub.org)

Mr. Duncan Meisel  
350.org  
20 Jay St. #1010  
Brooklyn, NY 11201  
[duncan@350.org](mailto:duncan@350.org)

Ms. Sabrina King  
Dakota Rural Action  
518 Sixth Street, #6  
Rapid City, SD 57701  
[sabrina@dakotarural.org](mailto:sabrina@dakotarural.org)

Mr. Frank James  
Dakota Rural Action  
PO Box 549  
Brookings, SD 57006  
[fejames@dakotarural.org](mailto:fejames@dakotarural.org)

Mr. Bruce Ellison  
Attorney  
Dakota Rural Action  
518 Sixth St. #6  
Rapid City, SD 57701  
[belli4law@aol.com](mailto:belli4law@aol.com)

Mr. Tom BK Goldtooth  
Indigenous Environmental Network (IEN)  
PO Box 485  
Bemidji, MN 56619  
[ien@igc.org](mailto:ien@igc.org)

Mr. Dallas Goldtooth  
38371 Res. HWY 1  
Morton, MN 56270  
[goldtoothdallas@gmail.com](mailto:goldtoothdallas@gmail.com)

Ms. Bonny Kilmurry  
47798 888 Rd.  
Atkinson, NE 68713  
[jackiekilmurry@yahoo.com](mailto:jackiekilmurry@yahoo.com)

Mr. Robert P. Gough  
Secretary  
Intertribal Council on Utility Policy  
PO Box 25  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[bobgough@intertribalCOUP.org](mailto:bobgough@intertribalCOUP.org)

Mr. Terry & Cheryl Frisch  
47591 875th Rd.  
Atkinson, NE 68713  
[tcfrisch@q.com](mailto:tcfrisch@q.com)

Ms. Tracey Zephier  
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan LLP  
Ste. 104  
910 5th St.  
Rapid City, SD 57701  
[tzephier@ndnlaw.com](mailto:tzephier@ndnlaw.com)

Mr. Robin S. Martinez  
Martinez Madrigal & Machicao, LLC  
616 W. 26th St.  
Kansas City, MO 64108  
[robin.martinez@martinezl原因.net](mailto:robin.martinez@martinezl原因.net)

Ms. Mary Turgeon Wynne, Esq.  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe - Tribal Utility  
Commission  
153 S. Main St  
Mission, SD 57555  
[tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov](mailto:tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov)

Mr. Matthew L. Rappold  
Rappold Law Office  
816 Sixth St.  
PO Box 873  
Rapid City, SD 57709  
[Matt.rappold01@gmail.com](mailto:Matt.rappold01@gmail.com)

Ms. April D. McCart  
Martinez Madrigal & Machicao, LLC  
616 W. 26th St.  
Kansas City, MO 64108  
[april.mccart@martinezl原因.net](mailto:april.mccart@martinezl原因.net)

Mr. Paul C. Blackburn  
Attorney  
4145 20th Ave. South  
Minneapolis, MN 55407  
[paul@paulblackburn.net](mailto:paul@paulblackburn.net)

Ms. Kimberly E. Craven  
Attorney  
3560 Catalpa Way  
Boulder, CO 80304  
[kimecraven@gmail.com](mailto:kimecraven@gmail.com)




And on December 29 2014, a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was mailed via U.S. Mail, first class postage prepaid, to the following:

Mr. Cody Jones  
21648 US HWY 14/63  
Midland, SD 57552

Mr. Jerry Jones  
22584 US HWY 14  
Midland SD 57552

Ms. Elizabeth Lone Eagle  
PO Box 160  
Howes, SD 57748

Mr. Ronald Fees  
17401 Fox Ridge Rd.  
Opal, SD 57758

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Kristen N. Edwards  
Staff Attorney  
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
500 East Capitol  
Pierre, SD 57501