## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA

IN THE MATTER OF REVISIONS AND/OR ADDITIONS TO THE COMMISSION'S SWITCHED ACCESS RULES CODIFIED IN ARSD 20:10:27 THROUGH 20:10:29.

## DOCKET RM05-002

REPLY COMMENTS OF MIDSTATE TELECOM AND RC COMMUNICATIONS, INC., d/b/a RC SERVICES

Midstate Telecom and RC Communications, Inc. d/b/a RC Services (collectively referred to as "Midstate and RC"), hereby submit the following reply comments on the proposed rules in Docket RM05-002.

As indicated in their initial comments, Midstate and RC support the Commission's proposed rules, with the revisions indicated in their initial comments. Midstate and RC support the initial comments of SDTA and SSTelecom and the initial and reply comments of SDTA and NVC and Sancom that oppose tying CLEC rates to the rates of competing ILECs, for the reasons articulated by those parties. Midstate and RC generally support the tiered rating system contained in the proposed rules.

Midstate and RC would like to comment further on ARSD 20:10:27:02.02. Specifically, Midstate and RC oppose the positions of Verizon, AT&T, and Midcontinent that appear to propose the elimination of 20:10:27:02.02(1). As noted in their initial comments, Midstate and RC support inclusion of the concepts embodied in this subsection of the rules, i.e., ensuring service to rural or remote customers, preventing cherry picking and provisioning of service only in the more lucrative urban portions of an exchange, and recognition of added costs and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> See Midcontinent's Initial Comments, page 3.

investment needed to fulfill carrier of last resort obligations. Midstate and RC believe the language they proposed in their initial comments achieves that goal:

(1) If a competitive local exchange carrier offers service with its owned or leased facilities throughout all the exchanges where it operates, the competitive local exchange carrier may charge intrastate switched access rates that do not exceed the rate established by § 20:10:27:12. A competitive local exchange carrier must offer local exchange service throughout all of the exchanges where it operates using its own facilities and may not rely on the facilities owned by an affiliate or subsidiary;

In their reply comments, NVC and Sancom appear to agree with the concepts embodied in this subsection of the rule, but their proposed revision is too restrictive as to whose facilities may be utilized. NVC and Sancom attempt to address the issue of reselling in their latest draft, but NVC and Sancom are confusing the concept of "leasing" with "reselling". This is apparent from the following language used by NVC and Sancom: "[t]he Commission may legitimately desire to prevent a CLEC from charging higher access rates merely by reselling an unaffiliated carrier's facilities." A carrier may resell the services of another carrier, but it cannot resell facilities. Again, the important policy embraced in this subsection of the rules is that the CLEC provide facility-based service throughout an exchange in order to be eligible for the higher switched access rate. Facilities-based services can be provided by a CLEC building its own facilities or leasing a portion of the facilities from another carrier, but the CLEC manages and operates the network it owns or leases to provide the service. Limiting facilities used by CLECs to those owned in whole or in part by a subsidiary or parent of the CLEC is not necessary to ensure that the CLEC is more than just a reseller of services. The language as proposed by Midstate and RC to 20:10:27:02.02(1) achieves the public policy of the subsection and also ensures that the services provided by the CLEC are provisioned through the CLECs facilities, whether owned or leased. Resellers who do not own or lease their own facilities are not entitled

to charge access rates under FCC rules, consistent with 47 CFR 51.605(b), because they are not providing any access services with their own network.

The Commission should adopt its proposed rules on CLEC intrastate access charges, with the revisions proposed by Midstate and RC.

Respectfully submitted this 28<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2010.

Darla Pollman Rogers

Riter, Rogers, Wattier & Northrup, LLP

319 S. Coteau - P. O. Box 280

Pierre, SD 57501-0280

605-224-5825

Fax: 605-224-7102

Attorney for Midstate Telecom and RC Communications, Inc., d/b/a RC Services

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Darla Pollman Rogers, certify that a true and correct copy of Comments of Midstate Telecom and RC Communications were emailed to the following on the 28<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2010:

MS PATRICIA VAN GERPEN
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
SOUTH DAKOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
500 EAST CAPITOL
PIERRE SD 57501
patty.vangerpen@state.sd.us

MS KAREN E CREMER
STAFF ATTORNEY
SOUTH DAKOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
500 EAST CAPITOL
PIERRE SD 57501
karen.cremer@state.sd.us

MS TERRI LABRIE BAKER STAFF ANALYST SOUTH DAKOTA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION 500 EAST CAPITOL PIERRE SD 57501 terri.labriebaker@state.sd.us

MR RICHARD B SEVERY
ASSISTANT GENERAL COUNSEL
VERIZON
201 SPEAR STREET 9TH FLOOR
SAN FRANCISCO CA 94105
richard.b.severy@verizonbusiness.com

MR THOMAS F DIXON ASSISTANT GENERAL COUNSEL VERIZON 707 17TH STREET #4000 DENVER CO 80202 thomas.f.dixon@verizon.com

MR DAVID A GERDES ATTORNEY AT LAW MAY ADAM GERDES & THOMPSON LLP PO BOX 160 PIERRE SD 57501-0160 dag@magt.com

BRETT M. KOENECKE ATTORNEY AT LAW MAY ADAM GERDES & THOMPSON LLP PO BOX 160 PIERRE SD 57501-0160 koenecke@magt.com

MR JAMES M CREMER
ATTORNEY AT LAW
BANTZ GOSCH & CREMER LLC
PO BOX 970
ABERDEEN SD 57402-0970
jcremer@bantzlaw.com

MR WILLIAM M VAN CAMP ATTORNEY AT LAW OLINGER LOVALD MCCAHREN & REIMERS PC PO BOX 66 PIERRE SD 57501-0066 bvancamp@olingerlaw.net MS MEREDITH A MOORE ATTORNEY AT LAW CUTLER & DONAHOE LLP 100 NORTH PHILLIPS AVENUE 9TH FLOOR SIOUX FALLS SD 57104-6725 MEREDITHM@CUTLERLAWFIRM.COM

MR THOMAS J WELK ATTORNEY AT LAW BOYCE GREENFIELD PASHBY & WELK LLP 101 N PHILLIPS AVE SUITE 600 SIOUX FALLS SD 57117-5015 tjwelk@bgpw.com

MR CHRISTOPHER W MADSEN ATTORNEY AT LAW BOYCE GREENFIELD PASHBY & WELK LLP 101 N PHILLIPS AVE SUITE 600 SIOUX FALLS SD 57117-5015 cwmadsen@bgpw.com

MR GEORGE BAKER THOMSON JR CORPORATE COUNSEL QWEST CORPORATION 1801 CALIFORNIA ST SUITE 1000 DENVER CO 80202 george.thomson@qwest.com

MR JEFFREY D LARSON ATTORNEY AT LAW LARSON & NIPE PO BOX 277 WOONSOCKET SD 57385 jdlarson@santel.net

MR RICHARD D COIT
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR AND GENERAL COUNSEL
SDTA
PO BOX 57
PIERRE SD 57501
richcoit@sdtaonline.com

MR TALBOT WIECZOREK
ATTORNEY AT LAW
GUNDERSON PALMER NELSON & ASHMORE LLP
PO BOX 8045
RAPID CITY SD 57709
tjw@gpnalaw.com

Darla Pollman Rogers