

**Exhibit 19**

**No. 12**

5-3) Has the Company received any executable price offers related to wind in 2016? If so, please provide any and all such offers, and explain why NorthWestern did not execute the offer.

Response: NorthWestern did not receive any executable price offers for wind in 2016. NorthWestern received an unsolicited offer from a counterparty that would be located in the Upper Midwest Zone. The offered base price, with escalation, for the 99 MW project equated to a 20 year levelized cost of \$21.61 per MWh. This price does not reflect any possible upgrade or congestion costs to NorthWestern's load. Due to the offeror's requested confidentiality terms, NorthWestern is unable to provide the offer detail.

Although NorthWestern would hesitate to add an unsolicited resource to its portfolio, NorthWestern considered the proposal to add 99 MW of intermittent wind resource to its portfolio. When it received the offer, NorthWestern had 125 MW of intermittent wind generation in its portfolio serving an average load of approximately 185 MW per hour. NorthWestern determined that having a total of 224 MW of intermittent wind to serve its load would add significant market sales to the portfolio and significantly increase the market risk to NorthWestern customers. Although it did not model the offered resource, NorthWestern believes that the offered price is consistent with its estimated avoided cost for the Juhl projects. NorthWestern expects the estimated avoided cost for 99 MW of wind would be lower than the Juhl avoided cost. This value of the 99 MW project would have been further reduced due to increased costs associated with known congestion in the UMZ between the proposed project and NorthWestern's load. This size project was not a good fit for NorthWestern's portfolio at this time.