

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION  
OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA**

---

**IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION  
OF TRANSCANADA KEYSTONE  
PIPELINE, LP FOR ORDER  
ACCEPTING CERTIFICATION OF  
PERMIT ISSUED IN DOCKET HP09-  
001 TO CONSTRUCT THE KEYSTONE  
XL PIPELINE**

---

\*  
\* STAFF'S RESPONSE TO KEYSTONE'S  
\* PROTECTIVE MOTION *IN LIMINE*  
\* REGARDING DAKOTA RURAL  
\* ACTION'S EXHIBIT LIST DATED  
\* JULY 7, 2015  
\* **HP14-001**  
\*

COMES NOW, Staff ("Staff") of the Public Utilities Commission ("Commission") and files this Response. On July 10, 2015, the Commission received Keystone's Protective Motion *in Limine* Regarding Dakota Rural Actions Exhibit List Dated July 7, 2015 ("Motion"), to which Staff now replies. Staff provides the following legal analysis, but takes no position on the Motion.

**Legal Analysis**

Parties are under a duty to supplement responses to discovery requests throughout the proceeding. SDCL § 15-6-26(e)(2) provides that

[a] party is under a duty seasonably to amend a prior response to an interrogatory, request for production, or request for admission if the party learns that the response is in some material respect incomplete or incorrect and if the additional or corrective information has not otherwise been made known to the other parties during the discovery process or in writing.

The purpose of the statute is to ensure a fair hearing to all parties. See, *Papke v. Harbert*, 738 N.W.2d 510 (holding that the nature of the statute requiring supplementation of discovery responses is not dependent upon bad faith; rather, the statute ensures a fair trial for all parties).

The South Dakota Supreme Court addressed the issue of late disclosure in *Kaiser v. University Physicians Clinic*, 724 N.W.2d 186 (SD 2006). In that case, the Court held that the

plaintiffs were denied a fair trial when the court permitted use of previously undisclosed exhibits. *Kaiser* involved the use by an expert witness of three exhibits that were not disclosed to the plaintiffs in discovery. The Court held that the use of the three undisclosed exhibits prevented the plaintiffs' counsel from effectively cross-examining the defendant's witness. *Id.* at 199.

The *Kaiser* Court arrived at its opinion based on a three-part test: 1) existence of bad faith; 2) whether the evidence concerned a crucial issue in the case; and 3) whether the substance was substantially different from that disclosed during the discovery process. *Id.* at 195 (internal citations omitted). The Court based its holding in *Kaiser* on the fact that the late-disclosed exhibits were a crucial issue to the case. *Id.* at 199. The Court noted that

[i]n cases...(involving expert testimony), a prohibition against discovery of information held by expert witnesses produces in acute form the very evils that discovery has been created to prevent. Effective cross-examination of an expert witness requires advance preparation. The lawyer even with the help of his own experts frequently cannot anticipate the particular approach his adversary's expert will take or the data on which he will base his judgment on the stand.

*Id.* at 197 (citing *Smith v. Ford Motor Company*, 626 F.2d 784, 793 (10th Cir. 1980)).

The Court has also noted that because SDCL § 15-6-26(e) is modeled after the federal rule, decisions by federal courts can help to interpret the rule. *Id.* at 196. In *Smith v. Ford Motor Company*, 626 F.2d 784, a federal court held that evidence should have been excluded because of the party's failure to seasonably supplement responses provided during discovery. *Smith* dealt with the failure of a party to disclose the substance of an expert's testimony prior to trial. *Id.* The federal court stated that the rules were designed to "prevent trial by ambush". *Id.* at 797. In that case, the court felt that the opposing party was prejudiced and that the prejudice was not cured. *Id.* at 799.

Other courts have found that where the opponent suffers no prejudice, substantive legal rights should not be forfeited, as it would result in the loss of a party's opportunity to have the case tried on the merits. See, *Allstate Ins. Co. v. O'Toole*, 896 P.2d 254, 257 (1995). The Court in *Allstate* held that "[d]elay, standing alone, does not necessarily establish prejudice. ...[T]he relevant question must be whether it is harmful to the opposing party or to the justice system." *Id.* at 258. The Arizona court further stated that "[w]henver possible, procedural rules should be interpreted to maximize the likelihood of a decision on the merits." *Id.* at 257.

Staff recommends applying the above-discussed legal analysis to the sixteen groups of exhibits categorized by Dakota Rural Action. When going through the groups of exhibits, the first question is whether or not the information was late-disclosed, or was it information that the parties knew or should have known would be presented in this case. If the answer to that question is that the parties were aware that the document would be presented, as in the case of the Final Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement, then the Motion should be denied with respect to that exhibit or group of exhibits and the parties allowed to make relevancy objections in the course of the evidentiary hearing. If, however, the Commission determines that exhibit was late-disclosed, it is necessary to ask the three questions from the *Kaiser* case.

### CONCLUSION

Staff recommends the Commission apply the facts of the matter to the above-discussed legal standard. Staff does not take a position at this time as to each individual exhibit or group of exhibits but is willing to offer input as requested by the Commission.

Dated this 16<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2015.



---

Kristen N. Edwards  
Staff Attorney  
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
500 East Capitol Avenue  
Pierre, SD 57501

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION  
OF THE STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA**

IN THE MATTER OF THE PETITION OF )  
TRANSCANADA KEYSTONE PIPELINE, LP )  
FOR ORDER ACCEPTING CERTIFICATION )  
OF PERMIT ISSUED IN DOCKET HP09-001 )  
TO CONSTRUCT THE KEYSTONE XL )  
PIPELINE )

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

HP14-001

I hereby certify that true and correct copies of Staff's Response To Keystone's Protective Motion *in Limine* Regarding Dakota Rural Actions Exhibit List Dated July 7, 2015, and Certificate of Service were served electronically to the Parties listed below, on the 16<sup>th</sup> day of July, 2015, addressed to:

Ms. Patricia Van Gerpen  
Executive Director  
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
500 E. Capitol Ave.  
Pierre, SD 57501  
[patty.vangerpen@state.sd.us](mailto:patty.vangerpen@state.sd.us)

Mr. James E. Moore  
Attorney  
Woods, Fuller, Shultz and Smith P.C.  
PO Box 5027  
Sioux Falls, SD 57117  
[james.moore@woodsfuller.com](mailto:james.moore@woodsfuller.com)

Ms. Kristen Edwards  
Staff Attorney  
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
500 E. Capitol Ave.  
Pierre, SD 57501  
[Kristen.edwards@state.sd.us](mailto:Kristen.edwards@state.sd.us)

Mr. William G. Taylor  
Attorney  
Taylor Law Firm  
2921 E. 57th St. #10  
Sioux Falls, SD 57108  
[bill.taylor@williamgtaylor.com](mailto:bill.taylor@williamgtaylor.com)  
(605) 212-1750 – voice

Mr. Brian Rounds  
Staff Analyst  
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
500 E. Capitol Ave.  
Pierre, SD 57501  
[brian.rounds@state.sd.us](mailto:brian.rounds@state.sd.us)

Mr. Paul F. Seamans  
27893 249th St.  
Draper, SD 57531  
[jackknife@goldenwest.net](mailto:jackknife@goldenwest.net)

Mr. Darren Kearney  
Staff Analyst  
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
500 E. Capitol Ave.  
Pierre, SD 57501  
[darren.kearney@state.sd.us](mailto:darren.kearney@state.sd.us)

Mr. John H. Harter  
28125 307th Ave.  
Winner, SD 57580  
[johnharter11@yahoo.com](mailto:johnharter11@yahoo.com)

Mr. James P. White  
Attorney  
TransCanada Keystone Pipeline, LP  
Ste. 225  
1250 Eye St., NW  
Washington, DC 20005  
[jim\\_p\\_white@transcanada.com](mailto:jim_p_white@transcanada.com)

Ms. Elizabeth Lone Eagle  
PO Box 160  
Howes, SD 57748  
[bethcbest@gmail.com](mailto:bethcbest@gmail.com)

Mr. Tony Rogers  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe - Tribal Utility  
Commission  
153 S. Main St.  
Mission, SD 57555  
[tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov](mailto:tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov)

Ms. Viola Wain  
PO Box 937  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[walnranh@goldenwest.net](mailto:walnranh@goldenwest.net)

Ms. Jane Kleeb  
Bold Nebraska  
1010 N. Denver Ave.  
Hastings, NE 68901  
[jane@boldnebraska.org](mailto:jane@boldnebraska.org)

Mr. Benjamin D. Gotschall  
Bold Nebraska  
6505 W. Davey Rd.  
Raymond, NE 68428  
[ben@boldnebraska.org](mailto:ben@boldnebraska.org)

Mr. Byron T. & Ms. Diana L. Steskal  
707 E. 2nd St.  
Stuart NE 68780  
[prairierose@nntc.net](mailto:prairierose@nntc.net)

Ms. Cindy Myers, R.N.  
PO Box 104  
Stuart, NE 68780  
[csmyers77@hotmail.com](mailto:csmyers77@hotmail.com)

Mr. Arthur R. Tanderup  
52343 857th Rd.  
Neligh, NE 68756  
[atanderu@gmail.com](mailto:atanderu@gmail.com)

Mr. Lewis GrassRope  
PO Box 61  
Lower Brule, SD 57548  
[wisestar8@msn.com](mailto:wisestar8@msn.com)  
(605) 208-0606 - voice

Ms. Carolyn P. Smith  
305 N. 3rd St.  
Plainview, NE 68769  
[peachie\\_1234@yahoo.com](mailto:peachie_1234@yahoo.com)

Mr. Robert G. Allpress  
46165 Badger Rd.  
Naper, NE 68755  
[bobandnan2008@hotmail.com](mailto:bobandnan2008@hotmail.com)  
(402) 832-5298 - voice

Mr. Louis T. Genung  
902 E. 7th St.  
Hastings, NE 68901  
[tg64152@windstream.net](mailto:tg64152@windstream.net)

Mr. Peter Capossela, P.C.  
Attorney at Law

PO Box 10643  
Eugene, OR 97440  
[pcapossela@nu-world.com](mailto:pcapossela@nu-world.com)

Ms. Nancy Hilding  
6300 W. Elm  
Black Hawk, SD 57718  
[nhilshat@rapidnet.com](mailto:nhilshat@rapidnet.com)

Mr. Gary F. Dorr  
27853 292nd  
Winner, SD 57580  
[gfdorr@gmail.com](mailto:gfdorr@gmail.com)

Mr. Bruce & Ms. RoxAnn Boettcher  
Boettcher Organics  
86061 Edgewater Ave.  
Bassett, NE 68714  
[boettcherann@abbnebraska.com](mailto:boettcherann@abbnebraska.com)

Ms. Wrexie Lainson Bardaglio  
9748 Arden Rd.  
Trumansburg, NY 14886  
[wrexie.bardaglio@gmail.com](mailto:wrexie.bardaglio@gmail.com)  
(607) 229-8819 - voice

Mr. William Kindle  
President  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 430  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[William.Kindle@rst-nsn.gov](mailto:William.Kindle@rst-nsn.gov)  
[ejantoine@hotmail.com](mailto:ejantoine@hotmail.com)

Mr. Eric Antoine  
Attorney  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 430  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[ejantoine@hotmail.com](mailto:ejantoine@hotmail.com)

Ms. Paula Antoine  
Sicangu Oyate Land Office Coordinator  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 658  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[wopila@gwtc.net](mailto:wopila@gwtc.net)  
[paula.antoine@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov](mailto:paula.antoine@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov)

Mr. Harold C. Frazier  
Chairman  
Cheyenne River Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 590  
Eagle Butte, SD 57625  
[haroldcfrazier@yahoo.com](mailto:haroldcfrazier@yahoo.com)

Ms. Amy Schaffer  
PO Box 114  
Louisville, NE 68037  
[amyannschafter@gmail.com](mailto:amyannschafter@gmail.com)

Ms. Debbie J. Trapp  
24952 US HWY 14  
Midland, SD 57552  
[mtdt@goldenwest.net](mailto:mtdt@goldenwest.net)

Ms. Gena M. Parkhurst  
2825 Minnewasta Place  
Rapid City, SD 57702  
[gmp66@hotmail.com](mailto:gmp66@hotmail.com)

Ms. Joye Braun  
PO Box 484  
Eagle Butte, SD 57625  
[jmbraun57625@gmail.com](mailto:jmbraun57625@gmail.com)

Mr. Robert Flying Hawk  
Chairman  
Yankton Sioux Tribe  
PO Box 1153  
Wagner, SD 57380  
[Robertflyinghawk@gmail.com](mailto:Robertflyinghawk@gmail.com)

Ms. Thomasina Real Bird  
Attorney  
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan LLP  
1900 Plaza Dr.  
Louisville, CO 80027  
[trealbird@ndnlaw.com](mailto:trealbird@ndnlaw.com)

Ms. Chastity Jewett  
1321 Woodridge Dr.  
Rapid City, SD 57701  
[chasjewett@gmail.com](mailto:chasjewett@gmail.com)

Mr. Duncan Meisel  
350.org  
20 Jay St. #1010  
Brooklyn, NY 11201  
[duncan@350.org](mailto:duncan@350.org)

Ms. Sabrina King  
Dakota Rural Action  
518 Sixth Street, #6  
Rapid City, SD 57701  
[sabrina@dakotarural.org](mailto:sabrina@dakotarural.org)

Mr. Frank James  
Dakota Rural Action  
PO Box 549  
Brookings, SD 57006  
[fejames@dakotarural.org](mailto:fejames@dakotarural.org)

Mr. Bruce Ellison  
Attorney  
Dakota Rural Action  
518 Sixth St. #6  
Rapid City, SD 57701  
[belli4law@aol.com](mailto:belli4law@aol.com)

Mr. Tom BK Goldtooth  
Indigenous Environmental Network (IEN)  
PO Box 485  
Bemidji, MN 56619  
[ien@igc.org](mailto:ien@igc.org)

Mr. Dallas Goldtooth  
38371 Res. HWY 1  
Morton, MN 56270  
[goldtoothdallas@gmail.com](mailto:goldtoothdallas@gmail.com)

Ms. Bonny Kilmurry  
47798 888 Rd.  
Atkinson, NE 68713  
[bjkilmurry@gmail.com](mailto:bjkilmurry@gmail.com)

Mr. Robert P. Gough  
Secretary  
Intertribal Council on Utility Policy  
PO Box 25  
Rosebud, SD 57570  
[bobgough@intertribalCOUP.org](mailto:bobgough@intertribalCOUP.org)

Mr. Terry & Cheryl Frisch  
47591 875th Rd.  
Atkinson, NE 68713  
[tcfrisch@q.com](mailto:tcfrisch@q.com)

Ms. Tracey Zephier  
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan LLP  
Ste. 104  
910 5th St.  
Rapid City, SD 57701  
[tzephier@ndnlaw.com](mailto:tzephier@ndnlaw.com)

Mr. Travis Clark  
Fredericks Peebles & Morgan LLP  
Ste. 104  
910 5th St.  
Rapid City, SD 57701  
[tclark@ndnlaw.com](mailto:tclark@ndnlaw.com)

Mr. Robin S. Martinez  
Martinez Madrigal & Machicao, LLC  
616 W. 26th St.

Kansas City, MO 64108  
[robin.martinez@martinezlaw.net](mailto:robin.martinez@martinezlaw.net)

Ms. Mary Turgeon Wynne, Esq.  
Rosebud Sioux Tribe - Tribal Utility  
Commission  
153 S. Main St  
Mission, SD 57555  
[tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov](mailto:tuc@rosebudsiouxtribe-nsn.gov)

Mr. Matthew L. Rappold  
Rappold Law Office  
816 Sixth St.  
PO Box 873  
Rapid City, SD 57709  
[Matt.rappold01@gmail.com](mailto:Matt.rappold01@gmail.com)

Ms. April D. McCart  
Certified Paralegal  
Martinez Madrigal & Machicao, LLC  
616 W. 26th St.  
Kansas City, MO 64108  
[april.mccart@martinezlaw.net](mailto:april.mccart@martinezlaw.net)

Mr. Paul C. Blackburn - Representing: Bold  
Nebraska  
Attorney  
4145 20th Ave. South  
Minneapolis, MN 55407  
[paul@paulblackburn.net](mailto:paul@paulblackburn.net)

Ms. Kimberly E. Craven - Representing:  
Indigenous Environmental Network (IEN)  
Attorney  
3560 Catalpa Way  
Boulder, CO 80304  
[kimecraven@gmail.com](mailto:kimecraven@gmail.com)

And on July 16, 2015, a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was mailed via U.S. Mail, first class postage prepaid, to the following:

Mr. Cody Jones  
21648 US HWY 14/63  
Midland, SD 57552

Mr. Jerry Jones  
22584 US HWY 14  
Midland SD 57552

Ms. Elizabeth Lone Eagle  
PO Box 160  
Howes, SD 57748

Mr. Ronald Fees  
17401 Fox Ridge Rd.  
Opal, SD 57758



Kristen N. Edwards  
Staff Attorney  
South Dakota Public Utilities Commission  
500 East Capitol  
Pierre, SD 57501

019843